

## RALEIGH HISTORIC DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION

### Minutes of the Business Meeting

Tuesday, February 21, 2017 - 222 W. Hargett St., Room 305

#### I. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Sarah David called the meeting to order at 7:43 am. A quorum was declared following roll call.

A. Roll Call: Teresa Young, Administrative Support, called the roll as follows:

Present: Elizabeth Caliendo, Sarah David, Don Davis, Sabrina Goode, Esther Hall, Jenny Harper, John Hinshaw, Laurie Jackson, Jimmy Thiem, Caleb Smith, Kaye Webb

Absent: Nicole Alvarez

Other: Rebekah Laney NC Modernist 27612; Martha Lauer, Executive Director; Tania Tully, Preservation Planner; Melissa Robb, Preservation Planner; Teresa Young, Administrative Support

#### II. CONSENT ITEMS

A. Approval of Agenda: Ms. David added item D. St. Paul's Windows under action items. Ms. Tully added item I. COA Meeting Update under follow up items. Ms. Lauer requested that the January 26, 2017 minutes be added to approval of minutes. Mr. Davis made a motion to approve the amended agenda; Ms. Web seconded; motion carried 11/0.

B. Approval of Minutes:

1. January 17 and January 26: Mr. Hinshaw made a motion to waive reading and adopt the January 17 and January 26 meeting minutes; Mr. Thiem seconded; motion carried 11/0.

#### III. ACTION ITEMS

A. Design Guidelines Update Deliberation: Ms. David thanked staff for attendance at all the city council meetings. Ms. Tully gave an overview of the process of the updates and the history as to what has happened so far. Ms. Tully reminded the commission that based on conversation at the Council Safe, Vibrant, and Healthy Neighborhoods Committee, in December the commission did adopt minor additional language in the Things to Consider as you Plan part of the sections on Additions and New Construction. Ms. David stated that the additional changes were vetted by planning staff and the compromise of language of 'glaringly different' was put in the narrative part of the *Guidelines*, but not as guidelines themselves. Ms. David added that members of the Society for the Preservation of Historic Oakwood (SPHO) submitted two additional guidelines at the February 2017 Council public hearing, stating "3.2.13 It is not appropriate to construct an addition that is starkly different from the original building in terms of architectural style." and "3.3.13 It is not appropriate to construct a new building that is starkly different from nearby buildings that contribute to the special character of the historic district, in terms of architectural style, materials, form, size, massing, proportion, roof shape, or overall appearance." Ms. David reminded the commission that council is looking for its input on these proposed guidelines. Mr. Hinshaw stated he would caution against using the word starkly, as the dictionary's definition is

very narrow. Mr. Thiem agreed, stating that he felt an emotional reaction to this word, which has a negative connotation. There was discussion amongst the commission about the proposed changes from the SPHO. Ms. Harper stated that she didn't find the suggested additional guidelines fundamentally different from guidance received from members of SPHO throughout the process, and that in her professional opinion as an architectural historian the proposed language is against industry best practices. In fact, the word starkly is found only in a caption of a picture in Preservation Brief 14. Ms. Harper further pointed out that the Design Guidelines Update process has taken many years, and she did not agree with the proposed language change. Ms. Jackson also added that she believed that this was not a bargaining process, and the commission should decide based on their professional judgment and experience. Ms. Hall made a motion that the commission recommend against the two guidelines as presented, because the language is prescriptive, and that the narrow definition of starkly discourages adaptive design; Mr. Thiem seconded; motion carried 11/0. Mr. Thiem made a motion to reaffirm the original wording that was proposed by the commission; Mr. Hinshaw seconded; motion carried 11/0.

- B. Plummer T. Hall House: Ms. Lauer reminded the committee that at the last meeting the commission voted to allow the executive committee to approve the RFP for release. Ms. Lauer stated the executive committee received a request from Preservation North Carolina to encourage city council to do a direct sale of the house to Preservation North Carolina. On behalf of the Executive Committee, Ms. Hall made a motion to issue the RFP as submitted; motion carried 11/0.
- C. St. Paul's Windows: Ms. David stated that St. Paul AME Church was undertaking a project to preserve their stained glass windows in partnership with the Wake County Historical Society. Ms. David recommended the commission sponsor window #27 for \$2,603; a small plaque recognizing the commission will be mounted below the restored window. Ms. Hall made a motion to allocate \$2,603 for the preservation of the window; Mr. Smith seconded; motion carried 11/0.

#### IV. DISCUSSION ITEMS

- A. Lustron Acquisition: Ms. Lauer reported staff met with the city attorney's office to discuss RHDC receiving an option for a lot; it is likely that Preservation North Carolina will need to be the pass through agency. Ms. Lauer also stated she met with house movers who affirmed the house could be moved in one piece; the UDC is designing a basement, which will require the hiring of a structural engineer to review and stamp the basement plans.
- B. Research Committee March Date: Ms. Tully stated that the research committee March meeting date will likely have to be rescheduled as this month's Certificate of Appropriateness Committee meeting may run long. There will be a committee follow up for the new meeting date.

#### V. FOLLOW UP ITEMS

- A. RHDC Press: Ms. Jackson reported that the Plummer T. Hall house was in the news recently and reminded the commissioners to send anything regarding the commission to

her, Ms. Tully or Ms. Alvarez.

- B. COA Appeal – 165-16-CA: Ms. Lauer reported that the case involving the denial of the ground sign at the Horton-Beckham-Bretsch house was upheld by the Board of Adjustment.
- C. Board of Adjustment Hearing Leesville Teacherage Variance: Ms. Lauer reported that the meeting is coming up on March 13<sup>th</sup>.
- D. Gables Motor Lodge: Mr. Thiem reported he met with people from the neighborhood to discuss the interest in the property. Mr. Thiem stated that they are interested in seeing the property preserved; he also met with one of the heirs of the property for discussion, and learned that several heirs have no vested interest other than selling it. Mr. Thiem stated he took the initiative and scheduled a due diligence session with the City on March 8<sup>th</sup> and will follow up with the commission once he goes through this process.
- E. Statewide Significance: Ms. Hall reported there are a number of properties that have the opportunity to elevate themselves to having statewide significance. Ms. Hall stated that a letter will go out to everyone regarding a meeting on this matter.
- F. David and Ernestine Weaver House: Ms. Tully stated the COA application for this will be heard at the COA meeting and that the case also made its way to the City Attorney's office.
- G. Oakwood National Register Nomination Update: No report.
- H. Housing Code Violations: No update.
- I. Community Development Division Housing Reviews: Ms. Tully reported that there was an internal staff meeting to discuss how the City manages section 106 housing reviews dealing with federal housing funds.
- J. COA Meeting: Ms. Tully reported that there will be an overflow date for the meeting, the evening of March 1<sup>st</sup> and that additional overflow dates will be booked for the remainder of the year.

## **VI. NEWS OF OTHER ORGANIZATIONS**

See as listed in agenda.

## **VII. OTHER BUSINESS**

Mr. Hinshaw reported that the Delaney house was approved for the subdivision of the lot.

## **VIII. ADJOURNMENT**

With no further business, the meeting adjourned at 8:53 am.

Sarah David, Chair  
Raleigh Historic Development Commission

Teresa Young, Administrative Support  
Raleigh Historic Development Commission