Nature of Project:
Remove paired windows on left side; replace with paired windows from same side behind 50% line

APPLICANT:
JASON RENZAGLIA AND KEITH LUNDAY

GLENWOOD-BROOKLYN HISTORIC DISTRICT (HOD-S)

This document is a graphic representation only, created from the best available sources. The City of Raleigh assumes no responsibility for any errors, or misuse of this document.

025-18-CA

709 HINSDALE STREET

GASTON ST

HINSDALE ST

N BOYLAN AVE

W PEACE ST
APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS – STAFF REPORT

025-18-CA 709 HINSDALE STREET

Applicant: JASON RENZAGLIA AND KEITH LUNDAY

Received: 2/7/2018  Meeting Date(s):
Submission date + 90 days: 5/8/2018 1) 3/22/2018 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: GLENWOOD-BROOKLYN HISTORIC DISTRICT
Zoning: Streetside Historic Overlay District (HOD-S)
Nature of Project: Remove historic window; install salvaged historic window

Staff Notes:
- The applicants have received approval for previous COA applications:
  - Minor work application (183-17-MW): Remove vinyl siding; remove ramp and replace with steps at side of front porch; remove aluminum handrails from front steps
  - Major work application (174-17-CA): Construct 2nd story rear addition; replace roofing; restore/replace exterior materials in kind; replace windows and front door; restore chimney; replace mail box and light fixture, and install ceiling fan on front porch; install driveway; remove and replace shrubbery
- COAs mentioned are available for review.
- Streetside HODs are “…established to provide for protection of the traditional development patterns of an area and to preserve historic resources found in it. The focus is on maintaining that character and on preserving those key character-defining features of individual historic resources within the district as viewed from the street right-of-way, excluding alleys…” (Section 5.4.2.A.1. of the Unified Development Ordinance)
- Section 5.4.2.B. of the Unified Development Ordinance governs the applicability of the COA process in Streetside HODs. Changes within the first 50% of the depth of any existing principal building from the facade adjacent to a public right-of-way requires a COA. For the sake of this measurement the house runs from the front wall (not the front of the front porch) to the rear wall (also not including porches).
- Only one of the pair of windows is within the first 50% of the depth of the house. Although the application requests replacement of the pair, the Staff Report only addresses the window within the regulated area of the house.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Description of Work</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>Windows and Doors</td>
<td>Remove window; install salvaged historic window</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
STAFF REPORT

Based on the information contained in the amended application and staff’s evaluation:

A. Removal of a historic window and installation of a salvaged historic window is incongruous according to Guidelines 2.7.1, 2.7.11, and the following suggested facts:

1* According to the Glenwood-Brooklyn Historic Overlay District Inventory, the house was built circa 1928 and was classified as contributing. The architectural description from the report reads: “One-story frame Craftsman bungalow with vinyl siding and an asphalt-shingled front-gable roof. The porch has tapered wood posts on brick pedestals. Other features include a brick foundation and exterior side chimney, a parged interior flue, and 3/1 windows.”

2* From Design Guidelines section 2.7 Windows and Doors, in the Things to Consider as You Plan section: “Changing existing window and door openings, closing existing openings, or adding new openings on a historic building should be carefully considered and undertaken only for compelling reasons. Changes to original openings in a character-defining facade should never be considered. For less significant facades, the pattern of proposed openings should be characteristic of and complementary to the historic building and the historic district context.”

3* The applicants propose removing one of a pair of 3-over-1 windows centered on the gable-end bump-out on the east side (left) of the house. The window is the same height as two windows that flank the fireplace towards the front of the house, but are narrower.

4* The applicants propose replacing the existing window with one of a pair of 3-over-1 windows of different dimensions that will be removed from elsewhere on the house. The “replacement” window appears to be nearly square and is much wider in proportion than the existing window.

Staff suggests denial of the application.
Raleigh Historic Development Commission – Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) Application

Development Services Customer Service Center
One Exchange Plaza
1 Exchange Plaza, Suite 400
Raleigh, North Carolina 27601
Phone 919-996-2495
eFax 919-996-1831

☐ Minor Work (staff review) – 1 copy

☒ Major Work (COA Committee review) – 10 copies
☐ Additions Greater than 25% of Building Square Footage
☐ New Buildings
☐ Demo of Contributing Historic Resource
☒ All Other

☐ Post Approval Re-review of Conditions of Approval

For Office Use Only

Transaction # 544208
File # 025-18-CA
Fee $147.00
Amount Paid $147.00
Received Date 7 FEB 18
Received By SWE

Property Street Address 709 Hindsdale Street

Historic District Glenwood-Brooklyn

Historic Property/Landmark name (if applicable) NA

Owner's Name Keith Lunday and Jason Renzaglia

Lot size 0.11 acres (width in feet) 50’ (depth in feet) 100’

For applications that require review by the COA Committee (Major Work), provide addressed, stamped envelopes to owners of all properties within 100 feet (i.e. both sides, in front (across the street), and behind the property) not including the width of public streets or alleys (Label Creator).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Property Address</th>
<th>Property Address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>705 Hindsdale Street, Raleigh, NC 27605</td>
<td>714 West Peace Street</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>706 Hindsdale Street, Raleigh, NC 27605</td>
<td>710 West Peace Street</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>707 Hindsdale Street, Raleigh, NC 27605</td>
<td>700 West Peace Street</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>708 Hindsdale Street, Raleigh, NC 27605</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>710 Hindsdale Street, Raleigh, NC 27605</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>711 Hindsdale Street, Raleigh, NC 27605</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>712 Hindsdale Street, Raleigh, NC 27605</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>713 Hindsdale Street, Raleigh, NC 27605</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
I understand that all applications that require review by the commission’s Certificate of Appropriateness Committee must be submitted by 4:00 p.m. on the application deadline; otherwise, consideration will be delayed until the following committee meeting. An incomplete application will not be accepted.

Type or print the following:

Applicant  Keith Lunday and Jason Renzaglia

Mailing Address  709 Hinsdale Street

City  Raleigh  State  NC  Zip Code  27605

Date  8-Feb-2018  Daytime Phone  919.79.7599 / 919.741.0946

Email Address  keith.lunday@gmail.com / jrenzag@gmail.com

Applicant Signature  [Signature]

Will you be applying for rehabilitation tax credits for this project?  □ Yes  □ No

Did you consult with staff prior to filing the application?  □ Yes  □ No

Office Use Only

Type of Work  $4,85

Design Guidelines - Please cite the applicable sections of the design guidelines (www.rhdc.org).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section/Page</th>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Brief Description of Work (attach additional sheets as needed)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.7 / 50</td>
<td>Windows and Doors</td>
<td>• Remove the original double window underneath the gable on the left side of the house (a portion within the front 50% of the house) (PHOTO #1), and replace it with the smaller, original double kitchen window that is located further back (behind the 50% line) on the same side of the house (PHOTO #2).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Minor Work Approval (office use only)

Upon being signed and dated below by the Planning Director or designee, this application becomes the Minor Work Certificate of Appropriateness. It is valid until _________________. Please post the enclosed placard form of the certificate as indicated at the bottom of the card. Issuance of a Minor Work Certificate shall not relieve the applicant, contractor, tenant, or property owner from obtaining any other permit required by City Code or any law. Minor Works are subject to an appeals period of 30 days from the date of approval.

Signature (City of Raleigh) ___________________________ Date ___________________________

### TO BE COMPLETED BY APPLICANT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TO BE COMPLETED BY CITY STAFF</th>
<th>YES</th>
<th>N/A</th>
<th>YES</th>
<th>NO</th>
<th>N/A</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Attach 8-1/2&quot; x 11&quot; or 11&quot; x 17&quot; sheets with written descriptions and drawings, photographs, and other graphic information necessary to completely describe the project. Use the checklist below to be sure your application is complete.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Minor Work</strong> (staff review) – 1 copy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Major Work</strong> (COA Committee review) – 10 copies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Written description. Describe clearly and in detail the nature of your project. Include exact dimensions for materials to be used (e.g. width of siding, window trim, etc.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Description of materials (Provide samples, if appropriate)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Photographs of existing conditions are required. Minimum image size 4&quot; x 6&quot; as printed. Maximum 2 images per page.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. <strong>Paint Schedule</strong> (if applicable)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. <strong>Plot plan</strong> (if applicable). A plot plan showing relationship of buildings, additions, sidewalks, drives, trees, property lines, etc., must be provided if your project includes any addition, demolition, fences/walls, or other landscape work. Show accurate measurements. You may also use a copy of the survey you received when you bought your property. Revise the copy as needed to show existing conditions and your proposed work.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Drawings showing existing and proposed work</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Plan drawings</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Elevation drawings showing the façade(s)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Dimensions shown on drawings and/or graphic scale (required)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- 11&quot; x 17&quot; or 8-1/2&quot; x 11&quot; reductions of full-size drawings. If reduced size is so small as to be illegible, make 11&quot; x 17&quot; or 8-1/2&quot; x 11&quot; snap shots of individual drawings from the big sheet.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Stamped envelopes addressed to all property owners within 100 feet of property not counting the width of public streets and alleys (required for Major Work). Use the <strong>Label Creator</strong> to determine the addresses.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. <strong>Fee</strong> (See Development Fee Schedule)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
To accommodate a floor plan that moves the kitchen closer to the front of the house, we propose to remove the original double window underneath the gable on the left side of the house (a portion within the front 50% of the house) (PHOTO #1), and replace it with the smaller, original double kitchen window that is located further back (behind the 50% line) on the same side of the house (PHOTO #2). See attached sketch for more detail.

- This change in opening would be on the left side of the house, a less character defining location than the front façade.
- This proposal retains the windows from the original kitchen, for use in the new kitchen floorplan, keeping the charm and imperfections in the historic glass.
- All materials used would be original and in-kind (original wood frame windows, trim, sills and original glass).
- The opening that would appear after replacing the original double window with the smaller original double kitchen window would be covered with original wood siding taken from the rear of the house, keeping the siding in kind with both sides and front façade of the house. This proposal would not interrupt the look/feel of the original wood siding.
- Since the proposed window replacement is original, the pattern of the final opening underneath the gable on the left side of the house would be patently characteristic and complementary to the historic building.
EXISTING LEFT ELEVATION

1/4" = 1'-0"

BLUE INK IS PROPOSAL
709 Hinsdale St: Front and left side
709 Hinsdale St: Front and left side
709 Hinsdale St: Left side