Nature of Project:
Landscape master plan;
install 12' sculpture;
remove non-historic chimney
(Hall House); remove non-historic
windows and replace (Hall House)
APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS – STAFF REPORT

059-18-CA 814 OBERLIN ROAD
Applicant: PRESERVATION NORTH CAROLINA
Received: 4/12/2018
Submission date + 90 days: 7/11/2018
Meeting Date(s):
1) 5/24/2018 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Raleigh Historic Landmark: Plummer T Hall House & Willis Graves House
Nature of Project: Landscape master plan; install 12’ sculpture; remove non-historic chimney (Hall House); remove non-historic windows and replace (Hall House)

Staff Notes:
- COAs mentioned are available for review.
- Two previous applications (COA 076-16-CA and 124-17-CA) were approved for prepping and moving both the Hall and Graves houses, as well as constructing foundations and some site work. Removal of non-historic additions and materials was also approved.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Description of Work</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>Site Features and Plantings</td>
<td>Landscape master plan; install 12’ sculpture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>Roofs</td>
<td>Remove non-historic chimney (Hall House)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>Windows and Doors</td>
<td>Remove non-historic windows and replace (Hall House)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

STAFF REPORT

Based on the information contained in the application and staff’s evaluation:

A. Executing a landscape master plan and installing a 12’ sculpture is not incongruous according to Guidelines 1.3.1, 1.3.2, 1.3.4, 1.3.5, 1.3.6, 1.3.7, 1.3.8, 1.3.9, 1.3.10, 1.3.11, and the following suggested facts:

1* Two previous applications (COA 076-16-CA and 124-17-CA) were approved for prepping and moving both the Hall and Graves houses, as well as constructing foundations and some site work. One condition of 124-17-CA was for a unified site landscape plan to be brought to the COA Committee for review.
2* According to the applicant, the site plan included in the application has been modified from its originally approved layout based on the City site review process. None of the modifications affect historic resources. The previously approved site plan from COA 124-17-CA is attached as staff evidence.

3* The previously approved COA included removing trees affected by the relocation of the houses, located within utility easements, or located in the proposed parking area; 6 pecans, 1 birch, 1 oak, 1 maple, 1 mulberry, 3 hackberries, 2 walnuts, 1 black cherry, and 1 unidentified tree. Five mature trees and several smaller trees remain.

4* A tree replacement plan was provided, showing 15 new trees.

5* A planting plan shows foundation plantings and a mix of species and sizes of new trees such as oaks, dogwoods and crape myrtles.

6* A tree protection plan prepared by an ISA-certified arborist was approved as a condition under COA 124-17-CA. The previously approved tree protection plan from COA 124-17-CA is attached as staff evidence.

7* The 12’ plaster and wire mesh sculpture was moved from the former site of the Lustron House, 3612 Buffaloe Road, temporarily to the property at 802 Oberlin Road to save it from being demolished.

8* The sculpture is proposed to be installed on an existing concrete pad behind the Hall House.

B. Removing a non-historic chimney on the Hall House is not incongruous according to Guidelines 2.5.1 and 2.5.7, and the following suggested facts:

1* The chimney proposed for removal is on the back of the main roof. According to the applicant, during relocation preparations the chimney was found to be “a 1990s dummy built of concrete block with a brick stack.”

2* Removal of non-historic utility chimneys is a minor work item approvable by staff, and is included in this application for efficiency.

C. Removing non-historic windows and replacing them on the Hall House is not incongruous according to Guidelines 2.7.1 and 2.7.7, and the following suggested facts:
1* The applicant proposes removing three ganged windows on the front porch and replacing with a single wood 6/6 double hung window. Evidence was provided for this configuration with a historic photo. In addition, the applicant states that parts of the original framing are in place.

2* Two other windows are proposed to be removed and replaced, one on the north side of the building and one on the right side of the front door. The applicant states the existing windows are “modern, cheap and smaller than the one surviving original window.” No evidence was provided by the applicant. The replacement windows will be wood 6/6 double hung windows to match the historic window on the south elevation.

3* Window specifications were included in the application.

4*

Staff suggests that the committee approve the application.
COA 059-18-CA staff evidence
Conditions approved: 124-17-CA

Tree Protection Fence, Phase One.
1. Tree Protection Fence shall be metal fence established after removal of undesirable trees and undergrowth from wooded areas.
2. Upon completion of the majority of the work and the removal of heavy equipment from the site, the tree protection fencing may be reconfigured into phase two to create the needed hardscape in this area.

Tree Protection Phases 2
1. This shall be established utilizing metal fencing.
2. Within the critical root zone of the large trees, hardscapes shall be created by building up the grade instead of cutting into grade.

Additional Notes:
- Construction access and laydown area to be located outside of phase one (red) tree protection zone at all times.
- Initial clearing of forested area shall be done utilizing small, rubber track machinery accessing the site to the far east. Great care shall be taken not to damage the trees.
- There shall be no grading or cutting within the forested area during clearing.
- Vines growing on trees shall be cut at the bast of the tree and painted with glyphosate in such a way that ensures glyphosate does not hit the tree.
- The large pecan tree to receive preventative borer treatments for two full growing seasons.

PELL ST studio
Address: 2700 N. Moultrie St.
Raleigh, NC 27654
(919) 828-9573

Where hardscapes are to be installed within the critical root zones of trees, the grade shall be built up instead of the foundation cut in. No cutting to take place within the critical root zones of retained trees.
Raleigh Historic Development Commission – Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) Application

For Office Use Only

Transaction # 551080
File # 059-18-CA
Fee $47
Amount Paid $47
Received Date 04/12/2018
Received By Pam Bart

☐ Minor Work (staff review) – 1 copy
☒ Major Work (COA Committee review) – 10 copies
☐ Additions Greater than 25% of Building Square Footage
☐ New Buildings
☐ Demo of Contributing Historic Resource
☒ All Other
☐ Post Approval Re-review of Conditions of Approval

Property Street Address 814 Oberlin Road (Relocation of Willis Graves House from 802 Oberlin Rd to 814 Oberlin Rd)

Historic District Oberlin Village (pending HOD-G)

Historic Property/Landmark name (if applicable) Rev. Plummer T. Hall House – Willis Graves House

Owner's Name Preservation North Carolina

Lot size .37 acres (width in feet) 105'-0" (depth in feet) 175'-0" (180'-0")

For applications that require review by the COA Committee (Major Work), provide addressed, stamped envelopes to owners of all properties within 100 feet (i.e. both sides, in front (across the street), and behind the property) not including the width of public streets or alleys (Label Creator).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Property Address</th>
<th>Property Address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>222 W Hargett St</td>
<td>806 Oberlin Rd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>802 Oberlin Rd</td>
<td>817 Oberlin Rd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>910 Oberlin Rd</td>
<td>815 Oberlin Rd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>801 Oberlin Rd</td>
<td>818 Oberlin Rd</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
I understand that all applications that require review by the commission’s Certificate of Appropriateness Committee must be submitted by 4:00 p.m. on the application deadline; otherwise, consideration will be delayed until the following committee meeting. An incomplete application will not be accepted.

Type or print the following:

**Applicant** Preservation North Carolina

**Mailing Address** P.O. Box 27644

City Raleigh | State NC | Zip Code 27611-7644

Date 7/10/2017 | Daytime Phone 919-832-3652

Email Address

**Applicant Signature**

Will you be applying for rehabilitation tax credits for this project? □ Yes □ No

Did you consult with staff prior to filing the application? □ Yes □ No

Office Use Only

**Type of Work**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section/Page</th>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Brief Description of Work (attach additional sheets as needed)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.3/23</td>
<td>Site Features + Plantings</td>
<td>The Willis Graves House and the Rev. Plummer T. Hall House have been approved for relocation and for the additions to be built with final approval to be based on conditions to be submitted. A unified site plan was requested as a condition of approval for the COA 124-17-CA. The site plan that we are submitting is in its final round of approval process with the Planning Department. The additions and site plan were designed to maximize the aesthetic of the historic houses by being clean and simple.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5/26-27</td>
<td>Walkways + Off-Street Parking</td>
<td>The Hall House is being relocated onsite. In prepping the house for this move, we found that the chimney was a 1960s dummy built of concrete block with a brick stack. The owner is requesting that the dummy chimney not be rebuilt. The dummy stack was not readily visible from the street, and the taller new foundation and the reconstruction of the North wing will make the stack shorter and even less visible. The existing Hall House is small, and the planned addition is small. The structure to support a faux stack will take up much needed SF inside the house. All interior historic fabric related to any chimneys has been removed over the years. No mantels or hearths remain inside the house.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7/51</td>
<td>Windows</td>
<td>As the interior demo has progressed on the Hall House, we have found that three of the four windows in the main house are modern, cheap, and smaller than the one surviving original window (South elevation). The exposed framing also confirms that the new mid-to-late 20th century windows are too small. The owner would like to go back to the original size with three new windows to match the remaining historic window. Two of the replacements will be hardly noticeable – only a few inches wider and taller, with the same 6/6 configuration. The third would replace a grouping of three modern windows on the front elevation under the porch. The commission previously approved replacing the center window of this grouping. The owner would now like to replace the grouping with a single window, matching the original.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2/41</td>
<td>Masonry</td>
<td>The owner seeks approval to place a 12&quot; sculpture of a dog by the artist George Morris on an existing concrete pad behind the Graves and Hall House. It will not be permanently affixed. Morris was the owner of the</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Minor Work Approval (office use only)

Upon being signed and dated below by the Planning Director or designee, this application becomes the Minor Work Certificate of Appropriateness. It is valid until _____________. Please post the enclosed placard form of the certificate as indicated at the bottom of the card. Issuance of a Minor Work Certificate shall not relieve the applicant, contractor, tenant, or property owner from obtaining any other permit required by City Code or any law. Minor Works are subject to an appeals period of 30 days from the date of approval.

Signature (City of Raleigh) ___________________________ Date ________________

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TO BE COMPLETED BY APPLICANT</th>
<th>TO BE COMPLETED BY CITY STAFF</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Attach 8-1/2&quot; x 11&quot; or 11&quot; x 17&quot; sheets with written descriptions and drawings, photographs, and other graphic information necessary to completely describe the project. Use the checklist below to be sure your application is complete.</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minor Work (staff review) – 1 copy</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Major Work (COA Committee review) – 10 copies</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Written description. Describe clearly and in detail the nature of your project. Include exact dimensions for materials to be used (e.g. width of siding, window trim, etc.)</td>
<td>✗</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Description of materials (Provide samples, if appropriate)</td>
<td>✗</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Photographs of existing conditions are required. Minimum image size 4&quot; x 6&quot; as printed. Maximum 2 images per page.</td>
<td>✗</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Paint Schedule (if applicable)</td>
<td>✗</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Plot plan (if applicable). A plot plan showing relationship of buildings, additions, sidewalks, drives, trees, property lines, etc., must be provided if your project includes any addition, demolition, fences/walls, or other landscape work. Show accurate measurements. You may also use a copy of the survey you received when you bought your property. Revise the copy as needed to show existing conditions and your proposed work.</td>
<td>✗</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Drawings showing existing and proposed work</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ Plan drawings</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ Elevation drawings showing the façade(s)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ Dimensions shown on drawings and/or graphic scale (required)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ 11&quot; x 17&quot; or 8-1/2&quot; x 11&quot; reductions of full-size drawings. If reduced size is so small as to be illegible, make 11&quot; x 17&quot; or 8-1/2&quot; x 11&quot; snap shots of individual drawings from the big sheet.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Stamped envelopes addressed to all property owners within 100 feet of property not counting the width of public streets and alleys (required for Major Work). Use the Label Creator to determine the addresses.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Willis Graves House and the Rev. Plummer T. Hall House have been approved for relocation and for the additions to be built with final approval to be based on conditions to be submitted. A unified site plan was requested as a condition of approval for the COA 124-17-CA. The site plan that we are submitting is in its final round of approval process with the Planning Department. The additions and site plan were designed to maximize the aesthetic of the historic houses by being clean and simple. The site plan has been modified somewhat since the initial application submittal and hearing due to comments and revisions requested from the Planning Department. As initially presented the site plan has been designed so that the two houses appear as they would be in a normal neighborhood street scape, two residential houses sitting side by side. The deck that connects the two houses is in the rear and will be obscured from street view by plantings. Parking has been located to the sides of the property where the road accesses are located so that the rear yard can be preserved for trees, grass, plantings, and walkways. The accessible entry will also be from the rear of the houses in order to keep the view of the historic houses from the street uncluttered. Plantings will be kept to minimal and what was typical for planting. The owner has photos of the houses with the plantings shown and hopes to create a similar aesthetic.

The Hall House is being relocated onsite. In prepping the house for this move, we found that the chimney was a 1990s dummy built of concrete block with a brick stack. The owner is requesting that the dummy chimney not be rebuilt. The dummy stack was not readily visible from the street, and the taller new foundation and the reconstruction of the North wing will make the stack shorter and even less visible. The existing Hall House is small, and the planned addition is small. The structure to support a faux stack will take up much needed SF inside the house. All interior historic fabric related to any chimneys has been removed over the years. No mantles or hearths remain inside the house.

As the interior demo has progressed on the Hall House, we have found that three of the four windows in the main house are modern, cheap, and smaller than the one surviving original window (South elevation). The exposed framing also confirms that the new mid-to-late 20th century windows are too small. The owner would like to go back to the original size with three new windows to match the remaining historic window. Two of the replacements will be hardly noticeable -- only a few inches wider and taller, with the same 6/6 configuration. The third would replace a grouping of three modern windows on the front elevation under the porch. The commission previously approved replacing the center window of this grouping. The owner would now like to replace the grouping with a single window, matching the original.

The owner seeks approval to place a 12’ sculpture of a dog by the artist George Morris on an existing concrete pad behind the Graves and Hall House. It will not be permanently affixed. Morris was the owner of the Lustron House, and the sculpture would have been destroyed but for the intervention of Preservation NC and RHDC.
814 Oberlin Rd

Existing Photos
Rev. Plummer T. Hall House
814 Oberlin Rd

Existing Photos
Rev. Plummer T. Hall House
Hall House 814 Oberlin Rd - Existing Front Elevation

Scale - 1/8" = 1'-0"

By Others
814 Oberlin Rd - New Front Elevation

Scale - 1/8" = 1'-0"

FROM PREVIOUSLY APPROVED COA 12.4.17 CA
814 Oberlin Rd - New Front Elevation

Scale - 1/8" = 1'-0"
New asphalt shingles to be installed on new roof
New asphalt shingles to be installed on existing roof
New window to match existing

Addition to be Added

Replace side entry door due to damage to the existing door. New door to be a half lite wood exterior door.
Brick foundation to have vertical joints at pier locations to indicate where piers would have been on the existing foundation

2x10 prtd wood rim joist
Patch and repair wood as needed for trim, siding, baseboard ceiling, columns, porch decking, rails + pickets etc.
Rails + pickets to be added, slm. to rails + pickets on the Graves House.

PELL ST studio

814 Oberlin Rd - New Hall Side Elevation (facing New Apartment Development)
Scale - 1/8" = 1'-0"
814 Oberlin Rd - New Hall Side Elevation (Facing Graves House)

Scale - 1/8" = 1'-0"
Past photo showing the original single window on the Hall House with shutters
Pressure treated wood framed green screen w/ metal mesh or steel fence panel in fill for vines to climb. Landscape designer has planned for Confederate Jasmine to be the climbing vine for the screen. This same detail will be used for the rails of the ramp along with a offset wood handrail on the interior for accessibility.

Pressure treated wood framed shelter to cover bike parking.

814 Oberlin Rd - Green Screen around Bins + Bike Shelter per Code

Scale - 1/8" = 1'-0"
George the Pup - The owner seeks approval to place a 12' sculpture of a dog by the artist George Morris on an existing concrete pad behind the Graves and Hall House, it will not be permanently affixed. Morris was the owner of the Lustron House, and the sculpture would have been destroyed but for the intervention of Preservation NC and RHDC. George Morris, a local artist, experimented with plaster and wire mesh creating a menagerie of animals that have been displaced by the closing of his Gotno Farm.
* Review for Egress. Refer to the "Egress Information Chart" PDF file.

all requested windows to be changed in this application will be this size which is the closest to the historic window on the South Elevation of the Hall House.
GLAZING OPTIONS

Single & Dual Insulated Glass available in operating and fixed units.
Grille in Airspace

| 5/8" x 3/16" ORIGINAL | 11/16" x 5/16" CONTOURED | 1" x 5/16" CONTOURED |

HDL, Surround and KD Grille Bar Chart

0.260" Exterior Wood Bar Height

0.260" Interior Wood Bar Height

PLEASE NOTE: STANDARD INTERNAL SPACER COLOR IS MILL FINISH
1704044729
EDWARDS, KELLY G
903 OBERLIN RD
RALEIGH NC 27605-1132

1704045385
OBERLIN BAPTIST CHURCH
806 OBERLIN RD
RALEIGH NC 27605-1131

1704044763
904 THE OBERLIN LLC
CHAD STELMOK
7100 SIX FORKS RD STE 100
RALEIGH NC 27615-6260