094-18-CA

904 W SOUTH STREET
BOYLAN HEIGHTS
HISTORIC DISTRICT (R-10)

Nature of Project:
Construct 3 roof dormers;
remove second back door

APPLICANT:
DANIEL AND ELEANOR TALLEY
APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS – STAFF REPORT

094-18-CA  904 W SOUTH STREET
Applicant: DANIEL AND ELEANOR TALLEY
Received: 6/13/2018 (9/4/18)  Meeting Date(s):
Submission date + 90 days: 9/11/2018  1) 9/27/18  2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: BOYLAN HEIGHTS HISTORIC DISTRICT
Zoning: GENERAL HISTORIC OVERLAY DISTRICT (HOD-G)
Nature of Project: Construct three roof dormers; remove second back door; remove and replace right side window
DRAC: An application was reviewed by the Design Review Advisory Committee at the July 2, 2018, meeting. Members in attendance were Dan Becker, Mary Ruffin Hanbury, Jenny Harper, and Curtis Kasefang; also present were staff members Tania Tully and Collette Kinane, and applicants Eleanor and Daniel Talley.

Staff Notes:
• COAs mentioned are available for review.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Description of Work</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>Site Features and Plantings</td>
<td>Construct three roof dormers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>Roofs</td>
<td>Construct three roof dormers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>Windows and Doors</td>
<td>Construct three roof dormers; remove second back door; remove and replace window</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

STAFF REPORT

Based on the information contained in the application and staff’s evaluation:

A. Constructing three roof dormers is not incongruous in concept according to Guidelines sections 1.3.6, 1.3.7, 2.5.10, 2.7.9; however, the removal of an existing window and replacement with a smaller window is incongruous according to Guidelines sections 2.7.1, and the following suggested facts:

1* From the National Register nomination for the Boylan Heights Historic District: “One-story bungalow; hip roof with hipped roof dormer. Engaged one-story porch, full facade.” The nomination form shows 1917 as the construction date and the status as contributing.
2* The application shows the approximate locations of four trees on the property. The tree protection plan consists of the following statements: “Construct tree protection fence around American Elm tree located on the east elevation of the home. Fence to remain in place throughout construction. No additional trees/plants will be impacted by construction.” A complete tree protection plan was not provided.

3* Three new dormers are proposed; one on the right elevation with a one-over-one double-hung window, one on the left elevation with a one-over-one double-hung window, and one on the rear elevation with paired one-over-one double-hung windows.

4* The dormers on the left and right elevations are proposed to have shed-style roof forms. The front walls of the dormers are set back from the wall plane of the ground floor.

5* The dormer on the rear elevation is proposed to have a hipped roof, similar to the existing front dormer’s hipped roof. The rear dormer roof peak is lower than the front dormer roof peak. Height dimensions were not provided. The front wall of the dormer is in the same plane as the wall plane of the ground floor.

6* Multiple discrepancies appear between the existing building drawings and the proposed building drawings. It is unknown if these are intentional changes to the design, as none of these are called out in the text of the application. The two sets of drawings were prepared by different firms.

   a. The width of the kitchen bump out on the left elevation appears to be narrower in the proposed drawings, and the roof form is changed from a shallow-pitched hipped roof to a hipped roof that is tied into the primary roof, albeit with a much lower ridge height than the primary roof ridge height.

   b. The rear elevation proposed drawing shows the bump out wall in the same plane as the back wall of the house rather than being slightly inset as in the existing building drawings.

   c. The rear porch appears much narrower in width in the proposed building drawings, with the shed roof at a steeper pitch that is also substantially higher than shown in the existing building elevations.

   d. Drawings show alterations to windows on the right elevation where a one-over-one double-hung window matching the proportions of the other windows is being
removed and replaced with a smaller one-over-one double-hung window. Window specifications were not provided for the smaller window.

7* Roof plan drawings were not provided for either the existing or proposed designs.

8* Photographs of other roof dormers in Boylan Heights were provided;
   a. 518 S Boylan Avenue – Received a COA (176-95-MW) for the addition of a rear dormer duplicating the original front dormer.
   b. 407 Kinsey Street - There are no COA applications related to the existing dormers. This ca. 1922 house likely included the side dormers with the original construction, or at least prior to designation of the historic district.

9* The windows in the dormers are proposed to be one-over-one double-hung wood windows in slightly different proportions to the windows in the historic house. The windows on the side dormers do not fill the height of the dormer wall which is atypical of dormer construction in the district. Complete window specifications were not provided.

10* The roofing, siding and paint for the dormers will match the existing building materials.

11* A new HVAC unit is proposed to be installed behind the existing unit on the left side of the house. No details were provided for screening material.

B. Removing the second back door is not incongruous in concept according to Guidelines section 2.7.11, and the following suggested facts:

1* One door is proposed to be removed from the rear elevation; the application does not state that the new siding will be woven into the existing siding so as to avoid the appearance of matching vertical seams.

2* The existing second rear door was added when the house was previously converted to a duplex.

3* Removal of doors from non-character-defining facades is approvable as a minor work item and has been included here for administrative efficiency.

Staff suggests that the committee deny the removal and replacement of the right side window and approve the remainder of the application with the following conditions:
1. That a tree protection plan be implemented and remain in place for the duration of construction.

2. That the new siding on the rear facade be woven into the existing siding to avoid the appearance of matching vertical seams.

3. That details and specifications for the following be provided to and approved by the COA Committee prior to issuance of the COA blue placard:
   a. Accurate drawings and project description to clarify discrepancies outlined in A.5.a – A.5.d above;

4. That details and specifications for the following be provided to and approved by staff prior to issuance of the COA blue placard:
   a. A tree protection plan prepared by an arborist certified by the International Society of Arboriculture or by a North Carolina licensed landscape architect that addresses the critical root zones and provides staging areas for construction activity and material storage;
   b. Manufacturer’s specifications for windows, showing both section and elevation views, and material descriptions.

5. That details and specifications for the following be provided to and approved by staff prior to installation or construction:
   a. HVAC screening.
Raleigh Historic Development Commission – Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) Application

For Office Use Only

- Transaction #: 558660
- File #: 094-18-CA
- Fee: $147
- Amount Paid: $147
- Received Date: 9/4/18
- Received By: 

Minor Work (staff review) – 1 copy

Major Work (COA Committee review) – 10 copies

- Additions Greater than 25% of Building Square Footage
- New Buildings
- Demo of Contributing Historic Resource
- All Other

Post Approval Re-review of Conditions of Approval

Property Street Address 904 W. South Street

Historic District Boylan Heights

Historic Property/Landmark name (if applicable)

Owner’s Name Daniel and Eleanor Talley

Lot size: 0.14 Acre (width in feet) 50 (depth in feet) 120

For applications that require review by the COA Committee (Major Work), provide addressed, stamped envelopes to owners of all properties within 100 feet (i.e. both sides, in front (across the street), and behind the property) not including the width of public streets or alleys (Label Creator).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Property Address</th>
<th>Property Address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>904 W South St</td>
<td>902 W South St</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>904 Dorthea Dr</td>
<td>620 Cutler St</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>906 W South St</td>
<td>911 W South St</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>901 W South St</td>
<td>908 W South St</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>811 W South St</td>
<td>903 W South St</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>913 W South St</td>
<td>905 W Lenoir St</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>910 W South St</td>
<td>903 W Lenoir St</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>932 Cloisters Dr</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
I understand that all applications that require review by the commission’s Certificate of Appropriateness Committee must be submitted by 4:00 p.m. on the application deadline; otherwise, consideration will be delayed until the following committee meeting. An incomplete application will not be accepted.

**Type or print the following:**

**Applicant Daniel and Eleanor Talley**

Mailing Address 904 W. South St

City Raleigh  |  State NC  |  Zip Code 27603

Date 6.13.18  |  Daytime Phone 703-772-9740

Email Address eleanor.talley@gmail.com; dtalley3@gmail.com

**Applicant Signature**

**Office Use Only**

**Type of Work**

Will you be applying for rehabilitation tax credits for this project?  
☐ Yes  ☐ No

Did you consult with staff prior to filing the application?  
☒ Yes  ☐ No

**Design Guidelines** - Please cite the applicable sections of the design guidelines ([www.rhdc.org](http://www.rhdc.org)).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section/Page</th>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Brief Description of Work (attach additional sheets as needed)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1/38</td>
<td>Wood</td>
<td>The owners of 904 W South Street hope to finish the attic without altering the existing footprint, adding two bedrooms and one bathroom to the existing three-bedroom two bath bungalow style home and remodel the existing kitchen. The proposed finished attic space will add approximately 686 square foot living area above the existing first floor and the scope of work will not expand the existing footprint. The only planned exterior changes to the home are the addition of three dormers (specifics outlined below) designed to be inconspicuous from the street and in keeping with other dormer styles in the neighborhood working to preserve and leave unaltered the character defining front elevation of the house.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4/44</td>
<td>Paint</td>
<td>In addition, the owners hope to remodel the existing kitchen, and remove one of the two back doors of the home (door to be removed is illustrated in pictures with red “X” on it). The home was originally built as a single-family home and was converted to a duplex then back to single family. Removal of the door will align with the current use of the home.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5/47</td>
<td>Roof</td>
<td>The proposed finished attic space will add approximately 686 square foot living area above existing first floor. The scope of work will not expand out of the existing footprint and the front of the house will not be altered.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7/51</td>
<td>Windows</td>
<td>The addition of two shed style dormers (one on the east and one on the west side) will not be visible from the road view of the house due to the elevation (see attached pictures) and landscaping (large trees).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Minor Work Approval (office use only)

Upon being signed and dated below by the Planning Director or designee, this application becomes the Minor Work Certificate of Appropriateness. It is valid until _________________. Please post the enclosed placard form of the certificate as indicated at the bottom of the card. Issuance of a Minor Work Certificate shall not relieve the applicant, contractor, tenant, or property owner from obtaining any other permit required by City Code or any law. Minor Works are subject to an appeals period of 30 days from the date of approval.

Signature (City of Raleigh) ______________________________________________ Date ______________________

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TO BE COMPLETED BY APPLICANT</th>
<th>TO BE COMPLETED BY CITY STAFF</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Attach 8-1/2&quot; x 11&quot; or 11&quot; x 17&quot; sheets with written descriptions and drawings, photographs, and other graphic information necessary to completely describe the project. Use the checklist below to be sure your application is complete.</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Minor Work (staff review) – 1 copy**

**Major Work (COA Committee review) – 10 copies**

1. **Written description.** Describe clearly and in detail the nature of your project. Include exact dimensions for materials to be used (e.g. width of siding, window trim, etc.).

2. **Description of materials** (Provide samples, if appropriate)

3. **Photographs** of existing conditions are required. Minimum image size 4” x 6” as printed. Maximum 2 images per page.

4. **Paint Schedule** (if applicable)

5. **Plot plan** (if applicable). A plot plan showing relationship of buildings, additions, sidewalks, drives, trees, property lines, etc., must be provided if your project includes any addition, demolition, fences/walls, or other landscape work. Show accurate measurements. You may also use a copy of the survey you received when you bought your property. Revise the copy as needed to show existing conditions and your proposed work.

6. **Drawings** showing existing and proposed work
   - Plan drawings
   - Elevation drawings showing the façade(s)
   - Dimensions shown on drawings and/or graphic scale (required)
   - 11" x 17" or 8-1/2” x 11” reductions of full-size drawings. If reduced size is so small as to be illegible, make 11" x 17" or 8-1/2” x 11” snap shots of individual drawings from the big sheet.

7. Stamped envelopes addressed to all property owners within 100 feet of property not counting the width of public streets and alleys (required for Major Work). Use the **Label Creator** to determine the addresses.

8. **Fee** (See Development Fee Schedule)

| YES | N/A | YES | NO | N/A |
904 W South Street COA Application Index

I. Project Overview
II. Location, Tree Protection & Context
III. Photos and Existing Plans of 904 W South
IV. Proposed Plans
V. Comparable Projects (with Photos)
VI. Proposed Materials Information
VII. Paint Schedule
I. PROJECT OVERVIEW

The owners of 904 W South Street hope to finish the attic without altering the existing footprint, adding two bedrooms and one bathroom to the existing three-bedroom two bath bungalow style home and remodel the existing kitchen. The proposed finished attic space will add approximately 686 square foot living area above the existing first floor and the scope of work will not expand the existing footprint. The only planned exterior changes to the home are the addition of three dormers (specifics outlined below) designed to be inconspicuous from the street and in keeping with other dormer styles in the neighborhood working to preserve and leave unaltered the character defining front elevation of the house.

The projected scope of work to be completed includes:

1) Construct two shed style dormers on the east and west side of the home. Dormers will not be visible from the street view of the home due to the houses elevation and the planned set back of the dormer. The dormers will be placed to align with other historic homes in the neighborhood (see attached pics of 407 Kinsey Street). The chimney original to the house was demolished and is no longer there. If it were still in place, the proposed shed style dormers would be located behind the original chimney of the house. Dormer windows will be all wood double hung windows (see attached cut sheet). Windows will be similar in size and proportion to match existing windows and will have similar grill patterns.

2) Construct a hipped style dormer on the rear (north) of the house. Characteristics of the rear dormer will match the original hipped dormer on the front (south) of the home. Dormer windows will be all wood double hung windows (see attached cut sheet). Windows will be similar in size and proportion to match existing windows and will have similar grill patterns.

3) Remove one of the two back doors of the home (door to be removed is illustrated in pictures with red “X” on it). The home was originally built as a single-family home and was converted to a duplex then back to single family. Removal of the door will align with the current and original use of the home. Door will be replaced with materials indicated in materials section.

4) Add an HVAC unit for the second floor (unit will be located on the west side of the home, beside existing unit, shown on attached site plan).

5) Repaint the exterior to match the existing colors, see attached paint schedule.

6) Interior work on the first floor will include remodeling the kitchen, relocating the washer dryer, run new duct work for the existing HVAC unit.

7) Adding a set of stairs to access the attic (2nd floor).

Exterior Finishes (See Materials List):

Shingles: Shingles to be used on the proposed dormers will be Certainteed Landmark architectural shingles to match existing;

Siding: The siding for the dormers and removal of second back door will be smooth-faced 6 inch wood siding with 4 5/8” exposure to match the existing siding.

Windows: The new windows on the dormers will be all wood double hung windows that will be of similar size and proportion to match existing windows and will have similar grill patterns. Window head trim will be 5/4 x 6 with a 1 x 2 cap to match existing. Window sills to be 1 1/2” to match existing.

Paint: Exterior paint will be Sherwin Williams and will match the existing colors. Certificate of appropriateness paint schedule is attached.

Tree Protection:

No trees/plants will be removed or impacted during the proposed construction. A detailed tree protection plan is outlined later in this document.
II. LOCATION, TREE PROTECTION PLAN AND CONTEXT
Site Plan – Per Imaps – Parcel Size is .14 acres (approximately 6,098 SF)
Site Plan Map 904 W South St.
Locator

Showing mailing list recipients located within 100 foot buffer; per http://maps.raleighnc.gov/PlanMailList/
Neighbor Notices

List of property owners within 100 feet of property for mailing:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Owner</th>
<th>Address1</th>
<th>Address2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MILLER, ROBERT M TRUSTEE OSVOLD, USE L TRUSTEE</td>
<td>913 W SOUTH ST</td>
<td>RALEIGH NC 27603-2159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RUNYON, SCOTT MERCER, KIM</td>
<td>911 W SOUTH ST</td>
<td>RALEIGH NC 27603-2159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HUBERMAN, JOSEPH G BROMER, RUTH E</td>
<td>904 DOROTHEA DR</td>
<td>RALEIGH NC 27603-2140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BARABASH, IGOR M BARABASH, MARY JANE</td>
<td>910 W SOUTH ST</td>
<td>RALEIGH NC 27603-2160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAUDILL, CHRISTOPHER R NIKEPOULOS, RACHEL I</td>
<td>908 W SOUTH ST</td>
<td>RALEIGH NC 27603-2160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOTSINGER, MICHAEL R MOTSINGER, CORNELIA P</td>
<td>906 W SOUTH ST</td>
<td>RALEIGH NC 27603-2160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LYNN, NANCY KIRK</td>
<td>932 CLOISTERS DR</td>
<td>FLORENCE SC 29505-3606</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WATKINS, WILLIAM WAYNE</td>
<td>903 W SOUTH ST</td>
<td>RALEIGH NC 27603-2159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NASH, ROBERT A NASH, DEBORAH WHITFIELD</td>
<td>901 W SOUTH ST</td>
<td>RALEIGH NC 27603-2159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BROWN, CRAIG MURRAY BROWN, LAURA M</td>
<td>902 W SOUTH ST</td>
<td>RALEIGH NC 27603-2160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REVOCALE LIVING TRUST OF FRANCIS J SHEETS &amp; KIMBERLY C FRANCIS</td>
<td>905 W LENOIR ST</td>
<td>RALEIGH NC 27603-2149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BARNARD, VAUGHN NOEL III BARNARD, MARY CHESSON</td>
<td>811 W SOUTH ST</td>
<td>RALEIGH NC 27603-2157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AURIGEMMA, ANTHONY IV DOWNING, ALYSON M</td>
<td>620 CUTLER ST</td>
<td>RALEIGH NC 27603-2138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JOHNSON, WYETH JOHNSON, BETH</td>
<td>903 W LENOIR ST</td>
<td>RALEIGH NC 27603-2149</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tree Protection Plan:

- Construct tree protection fence around American Elm tree located on the east elevation of the home. Fence to remain in place throughout construction. No additional trees/plants will be impacted by construction.
III. PHOTOS AND EXISTING PLANS OF 904 W SOUTH
Front of our home. Illustrates the elevation of the front of our home, even from across the street. Proposed shed style dormers will not visible from the street or across the street.
904 W South Street Right Side (East Elevation)

Front and rear view of right (east) side of our home. Proposed shed style dormer will not be visible from front or rear street level view.
904 W South Street Left Side (West Elevation)

Front and rear view of left (west) side of our home. Shed style dormer will not visible from front street level view.
904 W South Street Rear (North Elevation)

Rear (north) view of our home from yard and alley. Showing view of roofline. Rear hipped dormer will be visible from alley. Proposed hipped ridge dormer will match style of front (south) dormer.
EXISTING

MAIN FLOOR PLAN

SCALE: 1/4" = 1'-0"
EXISTING

REAR ELEVATION

FRONT ELEVATION

SCALE: 1/4" = 1'-0"
904 W Front Street Front Door

This show our actual front door as existing. No chance is planned to this door except fresh paint.
IV. PROPOSED PLANS
904 W South St Rear Exterior Door for Removal (North)

Red Outline with X shows door to be removed from home.
V. COMPARABLE PROJECTS (WITH PHOTOS)
518 S. Boylan Ave

Approved COA 176-95-MW (1995)-House most similar to ours in the neighborhood with roofline and design. Back addition with dormer similar to what we are proposing, although we would not alter the footprint. The addition of the rear dormer does not impact the historical roof design or character defining features of the home.
407 Kinsey Street

Same roofline as our home with dormers in a similar location to ones we are proposing for the front right and left of our home. We have altered our proposed dormers to a shed style to minimize any character defining alterations. Due to the elevation of our home, the dormers would not visible from the street.
VI. PROPOSED MATERIALS INFORMATION
ELEVATION SYMBOL LEGEND:

M.O. = MAUSONY OPENING

VALUES IN ( ) ARE MILLIMETER CONVERSIONS

BASIC UNIT CLEAR OPENING EXCEEDS 20" IN WIDTH, 24" IN HEIGHT & A MINIMUM OF 5.7 SQ. FT. FOR SECOND FLOOR AND ABOVE.

E1 BASIC UNIT CLEAR OPENING EXCEEDS 20" IN WIDTH, 24" IN HEIGHT & A MINIMUM OF 5.0 SQ. FT. FOR FIRST FLOOR EGRESS.

T BASIC UNIT IS NOT AVAILABLE WITH TRI-PANE GLASS.

## NUMBER INDICATES DESIGN PRESSURE (DP) RATING WITH STANDARD GLASS.

### NUMBER INDICATES HIGHER DP RATING, TALLER SILL STOP AND IMPACT GLAZING.
### Applicant
Eleanor and Daniel Talley

### Address
904 W South Street

House will be repainted to match existing paint scheme.

### Paint Manufacturer
Sherwin Williams

### Color Schedule

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Paint Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Body of House</td>
<td>SW 6779 Liquid Blue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Roofing</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Foundation</td>
<td>SW 6779 Liquid Blue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Porch Floor</td>
<td>SW 6779 Liquid Blue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Railing</td>
<td>SW 7006 Extra White</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Columns</td>
<td>SW 7006 Extra White</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Entrance Door</td>
<td>SW 7006 Extra White/SW 9178 In the Navy (Match Existing)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Cornice</td>
<td>SWSW 7006 Extra White</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Corner Boards</td>
<td>SW 7006 Extra White</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Window Sash</td>
<td>SW 9178 In The Navy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 Shutter</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 Door &amp; Window Trim</td>
<td>SW 7006 Extra White/SW 9178 In the Navy (Match Existing)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 Rake</td>
<td>SW 7006 Extra White</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 Porch Ceiling</td>
<td>SW 7006 Extra White</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15 Other</td>
<td>Match Existing</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>