107-18-CA

504 E JONES STREET

OAKWOOD HISTORIC DISTRICT (R-10)

Nature of Project: Demolish garage

APPLICANT: JUSTIN BONER AND KIERNAN MCGORTY
APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS – STAFF REPORT

107-18-CA 504 E JONES STREET
Applicant: JUSTIN BONER AND KIERNAN MCGORTY
Received: 7/09/2018 Meeting Date(s):
Submission date + 90 days: 10/07/2018 1) 8/23/2018 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: OAKWOOD HISTORIC DISTRICT
Raleigh Historic Landmark: CAMERON-MAYNARD-GATLING HOUSE
Zoning: GENERAL HOD
Nature of Project: Demolish garage
Staff Notes:
• Unified Development Code section 10.2.15.E.1 provides that “An application for a certificate of appropriateness authorizing the demolition or destruction of a building, structure or site within any Historic Overlay District…may not be denied…. However, the authorization date of such a certificate may be delayed for a period of up to 365 days from the date of issuance… If the Commission finds that the building, structure or site has no particular significance or value toward maintaining the character of the Historic Overlay District or Historic Landmark, it shall waive all or part of such period and authorize earlier demolition or removal.”

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Description of Work</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>Site Features &amp; Plantings</td>
<td>Demolish garage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>Garages &amp; Accessory Structures</td>
<td>Demolish garage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Demolition</td>
<td>Demolish garage</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

STAFF REPORT

Based on the information contained in the application and staff’s evaluation:

A. Demolition of an accessory building is not incongruous in concept according to Guidelines 1.6.5, 4.2.3; however, demolition of an accessory building that contributes to the overall historic character is incongruous in concept according to Guidelines 1.3.1, 1.3.3, 1.6.1, 1.6.2, 4.2.1, 4.2.2, 4.2.4, 4.2.5, 4.2.6, 4.2.7, 4.2.8, and paragraph one on page 82, and the following suggested facts:

1* The subject property is within the original boundaries of Oakwood Historic District listed in the National Register in 1974 and was designated as a Raleigh Historic Landmark in 2011.
The designation ordinance states “In 1920 a west-facing wood-frame one-car garage was built at the east property line.”

2* The garage is located in the rear yard along the east property line directly to the southeast of the house.

3* The application included historic photographs that show the garage on site in 1920.

4* The application includes Sanborn documentation that shows the garage in its current location in the 1914-1950 map. The Sanborn maps also indicate that the property has an extended history of outbuildings in the rear yard.

5* The applicant provided several photographs that show the current condition of the garage. The application describes foundation and rot issues and presents one photograph showing a deteriorated sill plate. A professional assessment of the structural integrity of the garage was not provided. Detailed drawings of the existing garage were not provided.

6* The weatherboard on the north and south faces of the garage was removed during a previous project to repair deteriorated siding on the house. No COA was acquired for this alteration.

7* Photographs included in the application show that a mature Japanese Cedar tree is located in proximity to the garage. A tree protection plan was provided. The plan notes that all proposed work will be completed by hand to protect the cedar tree.

8* The application states that the applicants intend to salvage all reusable materials from the garage for use in future projects on the property.

9* A post-demolition site plan was not provided.

Staff suggests that the committee approve the application with the following conditions:

1. That a 365-day demolition delay be imposed.

2. That tree protection plans be implemented and remain in place for the duration of construction.

3. That prior to the issuance of the blue placard the following be provided to and approved by staff:
   a. full documentation of the building with photographs and measured, scaled drawings;
   b. a post-demolition site plan.
### Raleigh Historic Development Commission – Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) Application

**Development Services**  
Customer Service Center  
One Exchange Plaza  
1 Exchange Plaza, Suite 400  
Raleigh, North Carolina 27601  
Phone 919-966-2495  
eFax 919-996-1831

- [ ] Minor Work (staff review) – 1 copy  
- [x] Major Work (COA Committee review) – 10 copies  
  - [ ] Additions Greater than 25% of Building Square Footage  
  - [ ] New Buildings  
  - [x] Demo of Contributing Historic Resource  
  - [ ] All Other  
- [ ] Post Approval Re-review of Conditions of Approval

For Office Use Only

- **Transaction #:**  
- **File #:**  
- **Fee:**  
- **Amount Paid:**  
- **Received Date:**  
- **Received By:**

---

**Property Street Address:** 504 E Jones St  
**Historic District:** Oakwood  
**Historic Property/Landmark name (If applicable):** Cameron-Maynard-Gatling House  
**Owner's Name:** Justin Boner and Kiernan McGorty  
**Lot size:** (width in feet) 109' (depth in feet) 144'

For applications that require review by the COA Committee (Major Work), provide addressed, stamped envelopes to owners of all properties within 100 feet (i.e. both sides, in front (across the street), and behind the property) not including the width of public streets or alleys (Label Creator).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Property Address</th>
<th>Property Address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>409 E JONES ST</td>
<td>105 N EAST ST</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>426 E JONES ST</td>
<td>107 N EAST ST</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>503 E JONES ST</td>
<td>109 N EAST ST</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>511 E JONES ST</td>
<td>112 N EAST ST</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>514 E JONES ST</td>
<td>116 N EAST ST</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>516 E JONES ST</td>
<td>118 N EAST ST</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
I understand that all applications that require review by the commission’s Certificate of Appropriateness Committee must be submitted by 4:00 p.m. on the application deadline; otherwise, consideration will be delayed until the following committee meeting. An incomplete application will not be accepted.

Type or print the following:

Applicant  Justin Boner

Mailing Address  504 E Jones St

City  Raleigh  State  NC  Zip Code  27601

Date  July 9, 2018  Daytime Phone  919-475-6756

Email Address  justin.boner@gmail.com

Applicant Signature

Will you be applying for rehabilitation tax credits for this project?  ☐ Yes  ☒ No

Did you consult with staff prior to filing the application?  ☒ Yes  ☐ No

Design Guidelines - Please cite the applicable sections of the design guidelines (www.rhdc.org).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section/Page</th>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Brief Description of Work (attach additional sheets as needed)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.2/82</td>
<td>Demolition</td>
<td>Owners propose to demolish a deteriorated one-car garage (c.1920) situated within 3 feet of the southeast of the house (c.1871).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Minor Work Approval (office use only)**

Upon being signed and dated below by the Planning Director or designee, this application becomes the Minor Work Certificate of Appropriateness. It is valid until ________________. Please post the enclosed placard form of the certificate as indicated at the bottom of the card. Issuance of a Minor Work Certificate shall not relieve the applicant, contractor, tenant, or property owner from obtaining any other permit required by City Code or any law. Minor Works are subject to an appeals period of 30 days from the date of approval.

**Signature (City of Raleigh)_________________________ Date_________________________**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TO BE COMPLETED BY APPLICANT</th>
<th>TO BE COMPLETED BY CITY STAFF</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Attach 8-1/2&quot; x 11&quot; or 11&quot; x 17&quot; sheets with written descriptions and drawings, photographs, and other graphic information necessary to completely describe the project. Use the checklist below to be sure your application is complete.</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Minor Work</strong> (staff review) – 1 copy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Major Work</strong> (COA Committee review) – 10 copies</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Written description. Describe clearly and in detail the nature of your project. Include exact dimensions for materials to be used (e.g. width of siding, window trim, etc.)</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Description of materials (Provide samples, if appropriate)</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Photographs of existing conditions are required. Minimum image size 4&quot; x 6&quot; as printed. Maximum 2 images per page.</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Paint Schedule (if applicable)</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Plot plan (if applicable). A plot plan showing relationship of buildings, additions, sidewalks, drives, trees, property lines, etc., must be provided if your project includes any addition, demolition, fences/walls, or other landscape work. Show accurate measurements. You may also use a copy of the survey you received when you bought your property. Revise the copy as needed to show existing conditions and your proposed work.</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Drawings showing existing and proposed work</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ Plan drawings</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ Elevation drawings showing the façade(s)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ Dimensions shown on drawings and/or graphic scale (required)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ 11&quot; x 17&quot; or 8-1/2&quot; x 11&quot; reductions of full-size drawings. If reduced size is so small as to be illegible, make 11&quot; x 17&quot; or 8-1/2&quot; x 11&quot; snap shots of individual drawings from the big sheet.</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Stamped envelopes addressed to all property owners within 100 feet of property not counting the width of public streets and alleys (required for Major Work). Use the Label Creator to determine the addresses.</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Fee (See Development Fee Schedule)</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. Written description
Owners propose to demolish a saddle-roofed frame one-car garage to the southeast of the house. The house was built in c.1871,¹ and the garage was not original to the house.

Dating the Garage
Below are the Sanborn Maps available for the house. The 1909 map depicts a detached kitchen; the 1914 map depicts the detached kitchen and likely an outhouse. In 1920, running water was installed in the house, the detached kitchen was moved and attached to the main house, and a bathroom was added to the south side of the house.² The 1914-1950 map depicts the garage.

---

¹ Inventory of Structures in the Oakwood National Register Historic District.
² Sanborn Maps, Raleigh, 1909 (Sheet 2), 1914 (Sheet 7), 1914-1950 (Sheet 7); Oral history interviews with former owner Bill Hutchins, February 2010 – February 2011.
The Inventory of Structures in the Oakwood National Register Historic District dates the garage to c.1940. In response to the current owner’s inquiry into the rationale for the 1940s date, Matthew Brown emailed, "No, I don't recall how I came up with c.1940. It is hard to date garages between Sanborn maps, because the directories and deeds are no help." In response to the pictures, Matthew stated, "It probably wasn't built while the USA was in the war (April 1917 to November 1918). If we are sure the photo is from 1920, we should date the garage to c.1916. Or if the photo is actually from, say, 1924, then we should date the garage to c.1920."

Because major renovations to the house (attaching kitchen, adding basement and bathroom) are dated to 1920, our best guess is that the garage was added at this time as well.
Rationale for Demolition

Because of the condition of critical elements of the structure, a thorough repair would essentially entail replacing the structure in its entirety.

- The foundation extends only 2-4" below grade and is not situated on a footing. A new foundation would be required to ensure a stable and durable structure.
- The sill plate has significant termite damage and rot due to its close proximity to grade. It would have to be replaced on all sides.
- At the suggestion of Mike Turner (a well-known painter of Raleigh historic houses), the owners removed a significant amount of wood siding from the garage to patch up many deteriorated boards on the main house because the old wood is thought to be superior to new wood available for purchase. Therefore, new siding would be necessary for the garage.
- The asphalt shingle roof is failing in places and would need to be replaced.

In addition to the condition of the garage, its location has an adverse impact on the property and the primary structure, which has been completely restored by the current owners from the verge of condemnation.

- Because the current owners tore down multiple, piecemeal, deteriorated additions to the southeast corner of the house and replaced them with a single addition that squared off the house (COA submitted in July 2013), the garage now sits only 3'1" from the house (1'11" if you measure to the garage eave).
- In addition, the garage is situated very close to one of only three mature trees on the .36 acre lot.

The current owners considered moving the garage, but the garage’s deteriorated condition makes a move impractical. As they have done for all projects on the main house, the owners would salvage all reusable materials for future projects on site.
Holes in roof

Proximity to main house is 3'1" (1'11" from garage eave)
Tree Protection Plan
There is a mature (22" DBH) Japanese cedar (Cryptomeria japonica) located within 6' of the garage. All proposed work will be completed by hand, and no heavy equipment will be used. If a dumpster is required, it will be placed in the driveway on the other (west) side of the house. We will install landscape fencing along the perimeter of the root ball for additional protection.
New Site Plan with Tree Protection Details

Scale - 1/16" = 1'-0"