This document is a graphic representation only, created from the best available sources. The City of Raleigh assumes no responsibility for any errors, or misuse of this document.

127-17-CA

533 WATAUGA STREET

OAKWOOD
HISTORIC DISTRICT (R-10)

Nature of Project:
Landscape/site improvements: install outdoor kitchen, replace lantern on brick post, install brick walkway, build small deck, install patio, construct accessory building

APPLICANT:
JOHN L THOMAS FOR GARDENER BY NATURE
533 Watauga Street
Comparable Properties
Built area to open space proportions

Based on our careful study of Wake County iMaps imagery and on our own familiarity with some of the properties, we have identified 39 other lots in the Oakwood Historic District that appear to have been built out to proportions comparable to what we are proposing for 533 Watauga St.

3 of these properties are adjacent to 533 Watauga St.

5 of the properties are in the same block with 533 Watauga St.

10 of the properties are within a one-block radius of 533 Watauga St.

18 of the properties are within a two-block radius of 533 Watauga St.

29 of the properties are within a three-block radius of 533 Watauga St.

39 of the properties are within a four-block radius of Watauga Street.

PROPERTY ADDRESSES

WEST TO EAST

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Address</th>
<th>Numbers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Boundary St</td>
<td>500 / 624</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pell St</td>
<td>306 / 308</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Euclid St</td>
<td>515 / 516</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leonidas Ct</td>
<td>609</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latham Way</td>
<td>600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Polk St</td>
<td>400 / 404 / 405</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakwood Ave</td>
<td>411 / 412 / 511</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lane St.</td>
<td>311 / 313 / 323 / 404 / 408 / 516 / 518</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jones St.</td>
<td>514</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edenton St.</td>
<td>401</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SOUTH TO NORTH

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Address</th>
<th>Numbers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Person St.</td>
<td>504</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bloodworth St.</td>
<td>100 / 130 / 216 / 302 / 404 / 610</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East St.</td>
<td>220 / 504 / 530</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elm St.</td>
<td>225 / 229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Watauga St.</td>
<td>509 / 529</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INCLUDED MAPS

Map #1 shows the entire Oakwood Historic District, with the subject lot 533 Watauga St highlighted in green, and the 39 comparable properties highlighted in red. This illustrates the number of comparable lots and their proximity to the subject property.

Maps #2 & 3 show the 500 block of Watauga Street in closer detail. The areas highlighted in blue are built outdoor space, including surface paving. The subject property is shown with the existing and approximated proposed exterior improvements highlighted in blue, and the remaining open space highlighted in green.

OTHER INCLUDED DOCUMENTS

Included are photographs and/or landscape plans of several of the noted comparable properties, identified by address.

We are in the process of narrowing down the list of comparables, checking COA histories, and photographing properties. We hope to give a slide presentation at the September public hearing to further illustrate the comparable proportions of built area to open space already existing in numerous sites in the district.

Design Guideline 1.3.8

"In the residential historic districts it is not appropriate to alter the residential character of the district (emphasis added) by significantly reducing the proportion of the original built area to open space on a given site through new construction, additions, or surface paving."

We believe the language of the guideline is clear that what is not appropriate is "to alter the residential character of the district". It appears plain to us that if a proposed project does not alter this residential character then it is not inconsistent with this guideline.
Map #1 shows the entire Oakwood Historic District, with the subject lot 533 Watauga St highlighted in green, and the 39 comparable properties highlighted in red. This illustrates the number of comparable lots and their proximity to the subject property.
Maps #2 shows the northern section of the 500 block of Watauga Street in closer detail. The areas highlighted in blue are built outdoor space, including surface paving an auxiliary buildings. The subject property is shown with the existing and approximated proposed exterior improvements highlighted in blue, and the remaining open space highlighted in green.
Raleigh Historic Development Commission – Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) Application

For Office Use Only

Transaction # 521778
File # 127-17 - CA
Fee 147
Amount Paid 147
Received Date 7-13-17
Received By -

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Property Street Address</th>
<th>Property Address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>533 Watauga Street</td>
<td>see attached list - 12 addresses</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Property District: Oakwood

Historic Property/Landmark name (if applicable):

Owner's Name: Steve and Lynn McCulloch

Lot Size: 5150 SF (width in feet) 50 (depth in feet) 103

For applications that require review by the COA Committee (Major Work), provide addressed, stamped envelopes to owners of all properties within 100 feet (i.e. both sides, in front (across the street), and behind the property) not including the width of public streets or alleys (Label Creator).
I understand that all applications that require review by the commission’s Certificate of Appropriateness Committee must be submitted by 4:00 p.m. on the application deadline; otherwise, consideration will be delayed until the following committee meeting. An incomplete application will not be accepted.

Type or print the following:

Applicant: John G. Thomas, for Gardener by Nature LLC  
Mailing Address: 5508 Swiftbrook Circle  
City: Raleigh  
State: NC  
Zip Code: 27606  
Date:  
Daytime Phone: 919-810-1927  
Cell Phone: 919-828-2015  
Office Phone:  
Email Address: john@gardenerbynature.com  
Applicant Signature: 

Will you be applying for rehabilitation tax credits for this project?  ☐ Yes  ☑ No  
Did you consult with staff prior to filing the application?  ☑ Yes  ☐ No

Office Use Only  
Type of Work:  

Design Guidelines - Please cite the applicable sections of the design guidelines (www.rhdc.org).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section/Page</th>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Brief Description of Work (attach additional sheets as needed)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1.3/23       | Site Features    | - New Outdoor kitchen -  
| 1.7/23       | Lighting         | - Replace lantern on Brick post -  
| 1.5/27       | Walkways         | - New brick walk to Back yard -  
| 1.6/29       | Accessory Structures | - New Trash can platform -  
|              |                  | - New rear patio -  
|              |                  | - New Workshop Building -  

PAGE 2 OF 3  
WWW.RALEIGHNC.GOV  
REVISION 08.29.16
**Minor Work Approval (office use only)**

Upon being signed and dated below by the Planning Director or designee, this application becomes the Minor Work Certificate of Appropriateness. It is valid until _______________. Please post the enclosed placard form of the certificate as indicated at the bottom of the card. Issuance of a Minor Work Certificate shall not relieve the applicant, contractor, tenant, or property owner from obtaining any other permit required by City Code or any law. Minor Works are subject to an appeals period of 30 days from the date of approval.

Signature (City of Raleigh) ___________________________ Date ______________

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TO BE COMPLETED BY APPLICANT</th>
<th>TO BE COMPLETED BY CITY STAFF</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Attach 8-1/2&quot; x 11&quot; or 11&quot; x 17&quot; sheets with written descriptions and drawings, photographs, and other graphic information necessary to completely describe the project. Use the checklist below to be sure your application is complete.</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Minor Work</strong> (staff review) – 1 copy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Major Work</strong> (COA Committee review) – 10 copies</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Written description. Describe clearly and in detail the nature of your project. Include exact dimensions for materials to be used (e.g. width of siding, window trim, etc.)</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Description of materials (Provide samples, if appropriate)</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Photographs of existing conditions are required. Minimum image size 4&quot; x 6&quot; as printed. Maximum 2 images per page.</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Paint Schedule (if applicable)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Plot plan (if applicable). A plot plan showing relationship of buildings, additions, sidewalks, drives, trees, property lines, etc., must be provided if your project includes any addition, demolition, fences/walls, or other landscape work. Show accurate measurements. You may also use a copy of the survey you received when you bought your property. Revise the copy as needed to show existing conditions and your proposed work.</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Drawings showing existing and proposed work</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ Plan drawings</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ Elevation drawings showing the façade(s)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ Dimensions shown on drawings and/or graphic scale (required)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>□ 11&quot; x 17&quot; or 8-1/2&quot; x 11&quot; reductions of full-size drawings. If reduced size is so small as to be illegible, make 11&quot; x 17&quot; or 8-1/2&quot; x 11&quot; snap shots of individual drawings from the big sheet.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Stamped envelopes addressed to all property owners within 100 feet of property not counting the width of public streets and alleys (required for Major Work). Use the Label Creator to determine the addresses.</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Fee (See Development Fee Schedule)</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1714010785
MCCULLOCH, LYNN J MCCULLOCH, STEPHEN H
533 WATAUGA ST
RALEIGH NC 27604-1969

1704918770
HALLAM, GREGORY L HALLAM, MADONNA P
601 LEONIDAS CT
RALEIGH NC 27604-1978

1704919833
GRABIEC, MICHAEL P GRABIEC, NICOLE M
612 N BOUNDARY ST
RALEIGH NC 27604-1955

1704919683
CHAKSAPA, DAN
618 N BOUNDARY ST
RALEIGH NC 27604-1955

1714010718
PRUETT, PATRICE LEANNE
609 LEONIDAS CT
RALEIGH NC 27604-1978

1714010780
S & H PROPERTIES LLC
4600 PARK RD STE 300
CHARLOTTE NC 28209-2289

1714010843
NATHANSON, MELVILLE B DITTMER, KRISTINE L
620 N BOUNDARY ST
RALEIGH NC 27604-1955

1714110503
BERNEY, ADRIENNE W KAZNICKI, RICHARD M
624 N BOUNDARY ST
RALEIGH NC 27604-1955

1714110500
RALEIGH CITY OF
PO BOX 590
RALEIGH NC 27602-0590

1714110503
RALEIGH CEMETERY ASSOCIATION
701 OAKWOOD AVE
RALEIGH NC 27601-1161

1704919744
BEAMAN, OLIVER J JR BEAMAN, MELISSA H
521 N BOUNDARY ST
RALEIGH NC 27604-1952

1714010670
TAYLOR, STEPHEN TAYLOR, KATELYN K
525 WATAUGA ST
RALEIGH NC 27604-1069
Proposed Landscape Improvements
For
533 Watauga Street
Oakwood Historic District
Major Work COA

Gardener by Nature LLC
July 13, 2017
Design by John L. Thomas
Property History
(from “Inventory of Structures...” Brown)

- WA6992 (NC) 533 Watauga St. Barbara Zimmerman House 1995 This frame two-story was built for Barbara Zimmerman. Its design was inspired by the Queen Anne style. Additional woodwork was added after 2010.
- BM1986:2214 this is part of tract 1 of Greenhouse properties
- 3833:477 J. J. Fallon & Co to Greenhouse Associates Sep 26, 1986 three tracts totaling slightly over 3 acres
- BM1988:570 Plat map of “Oakwood Green” recorded May 3, 1988, divides property into 21 or 22 tracts.
- 6144:315 Greenhouse Assoc to Barbara Zimmerman May 26, 1994 $23.5K
- 11960:1612 Barbara Zimmerman to Jason Mullen May 17, 2006 $361K

PROPOSED ALTERATIONS

NEW OUTDOOR KITCHEN
1.3 -p23 -Site Features

- Remove the existing plantings (roses) along the S wall between the side porch and the rear deck.

- Build brick posts – 30” x 30” x 32” high – at each end of the S wall. Brick should match the existing posts on the S boundary. Posts are to have smooth stone caps matching the stone to be used in new rear patio.

-- Install grill, smoker, worktops etc. between the brick posts.

- 47.5 SF

NEW POST LANTERN
1.3 -p23 -Site Features
1.7 -p31 -Lighting

Replace the existing lantern fixture on the East end-post of the boundary fence with a new and more period-appropriate fixture. Detail forthcoming.

NEW PASSAGE TO BACK
1.3 -p23 -Site Features
1.5 -p27 -Walkways

- Remove the existing wooden fence and trellis at SW corner of house.

- Remove the existing irregular bluestone paving.

- Install a new dry-laid brick walk – 45” wide x 27’ long – from the existing brick patio to the proposed new stone patio in the rear. Brick pavers should match those in the existing adjoining brick patio.

- 75 SF
TRASH CAN DECK AND RAMP
1.3 -23 -Site Features
1.5 -p27 -Walkways

- Build a small wooden deck – 72” x 30” x 10” high – to store trash and recycle bins. Build a wooden ramp – 48” x 72” – connecting the new can deck to the new brick passage.

- The east end of the deck framing is to be bolted to the existing brick post. The west end is to rest on minimal footings devised to avoid damage to the root system of the nearby Crape Myrtle tree.

- 39 SF

NEW REAR PATIO
1.3 -p23 -Site Features

- Install a new patio of tightly laid natural stone pavers. The patio area consists of two 16’ diameter circles joined by a passage approximately 5’ x 6’.

- The patio is positioned and shaped to preserve the root systems of 3 adjacent mature trees.

- The NW circle has a central fire bowl, 3 sitting walls approx. 18” high, and a wall-mounted fountain.

The SE circle has a single sitting wall, and is slightly altered in shape to accommodate the roots of the nearby tulip magnolia tree.

- 425 SF

NEW WORKSHOP BUILDING
1.6 -p29 -Accessory Structures

- Build a new workshop building - 8’ x 14’ – in the NE corner of the back yard. The building is modeled on an existing building at 213 N. Bloodworth St. It features a shed roof with a pair of rolling doors and a narrow strip of clerestory windows above. Siding and paint to match that on the house.

- Building included electrical service and a new spigot either on the building wall or on the nearby house wall.
NEW OUTDOOR KITCHEN
1.3 -p23 -Site Features

- Remove the existing plantings (roses) along the S wall between the side porch and the rear deck.

- Build brick posts - 30" x 30" x 32" high - at each end of the S wall. Brick should match the existing posts on the S boundary. Posts are to have smooth stone caps matching the stone to be used in new rear patio.

-- Install grill, smoker, worktops etc. between the brick posts.

- 47.5 SF

The kitchen will be along the wall on the right in the photo. The steps in the lower right corner lead from the brick patio to the side porch.
NEW POST LANTERN
1.3 -p23 -Site Features
1.7 -p31 -Lighting

Replace the existing lantern fixture on the East end-post of the boundary fence with a new and more period-appropriate fixture. Detail forthcoming.

Existing post fixture.

Replacement fixture should be styled more like this one at 123 N. Bloodworth St.
NEW PASSAGE TO BACK
1.3 - p23 - Site Features
1.5 - p27 - Walkways

- Remove the existing wooden fence and trellis at SW corner of house.

- Remove the existing irregular bluestone paving.

- Install a new dry-laid brick walk – 45” wide x 27’ long – from the existing brick patio to the proposed new stone patio in the rear. Brick pavers should match those in the existing adjoining brick patio.

- 75 SF
TRASH CAN DECK AND RAMP
1.3 -23 -Site Features
1.5 -p27 -Walkways

- Build a small wooden deck – 72” x 30” x 10” high – to store trash and recycle bins. Build a wooden ramp – 48” x 72” – connecting the new can deck to the new brick passage.

- The east end of the deck framing is to be bolted to the existing brick post. The west end is to rest on minimal footings devised to avoid damage to the root system of the nearby Crape Myrtle tree.

-39 SF

Site of proposed can platform.
NEW REAR PATIO
1.3 -p23 -Site Features

-Install a new patio of tightly laid natural stone pavers. The patio area consists of two 16' diameter circles joined by a passage approximately 5' x 6'.

-The patio is positioned and shaped to preserve the root systems of 3 adjacent mature trees.

-The NW circle has a central fire bowl, 3 sitting walls approx. 18" high, and a wall-mounted fountain.

The SE circle has a single sitting wall, and is slightly altered in shape to accommodate the roots of the nearby tulip magnolia tree.

-425 SF
NEW WORKSHOP BUILDING
1.6 -p29 -Accessory Structures

- Build a new workshop building - 8' x 14' - in the NE corner of the back yard. The building is modeled on an existing building at N. Bloodworth St. (see photo included) and features a shed roof with a pair of rolling doors and a narrow strip of clerestory windows above. Siding and paint to match that on the house.

- Building included electrical service and a new spigot either on the building wall or on the nearby house wall.

Site of proposed workshop.

This building at 213 N Bloodworth Street is the model for the proposed workshop.
siding and paint to match house.

Proposed Accessory Building
McCulloch - 533 Watanga Street
August 9, 2017

To whom it may concern:

I am writing this letter as an approval of the work proposed by John Thomas of Gardener by Nature, while considering the preservation of the trees located at 533 Watauga Street. I have met with John Thomas to review the plans for the hardscape development near the root zones of the trees in the backyard. The main one in question is the Crepe Myrtle at the left side of the home. The original plans have outlined a masonry path to be laid along the side of the house. The closest point to the root flare of the Crepe Myrtle is 24” from the edge of the path to the edge of the root flare. The distance grows exponentially higher in either direction of the path. No construction shall take place within this 24” zone.

Upon visual inspection of the tree along with the written plans, I feel this is an ample protection zone for this tree. If we view the entire root plate as a pie, only 20% or less of that pie is impacted due to the addition of this hardscape. I feel we can further reduce the impact to the root zone if the following steps are taken during construction:

1. Bartlett will provide a Fortifite treatment prior to construction to aid in maintaining health and vitality throughout the construction process.
2. Organic matter and soil will need to be added prior to construction to build up the surface area on the Crepe Myrtle, specifically. This will raise the soil level by 1-2” surrounding this tree.
3. By adding soil, this will lessen the depth of excavation needed for the path and will reduce how many surface roots will need to be severed.
4. Upon completion of the project a liquid fertilizer will be applied to help promote root growth and overall plant vitality as the trees respond to the construction process.

I believe if the above mentioned steps are followed, these trees will respond well to the planned construction.

Thank you,

Jared Kibbe
ISA Certified Arborist #SO-7534A
Bartlett Tree Experts Arborist Representative
INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: OAKWOOD HISTORIC DISTRICT
Zoning: HOD-G
Nature of Project: Landscape/site improvements: install outdoor kitchen, replace lantern on brick post, install brick walkway, build small deck, install patio, construct accessory building

Staff Notes:
- COAs mentioned are available for review.
- This case was deferred from the August 24 COA meeting to allow for design revisions reflecting input from the COA Committee.
- Changes to this report reflecting the amended application are shown in bold.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Description of Work</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>Site Features and Plantings</td>
<td>Landscape/site improvements: install outdoor kitchen, replace lantern on brick post, install patio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>Walkways, Driveways and Off-street Parking</td>
<td>Install brick walkway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Decks</td>
<td>Build small deck</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Additions</td>
<td>Construct accessory building</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

STAFF REPORT

Based on the information contained in the application and staff’s evaluation:

A. Landscape and site improvements such as installing an outdoor kitchen, replacing a lantern on a brick post, and installing a patio are not incongruous in concept according to Guidelines 1.3.1, 1.3.2, 1.3.7, 1.3.9, 1.3.13; however, the increase of built area may be incongruous according to Guideline 1.3.8, and the following suggested facts:

1* The property features a two-story Queen Anne-inspired house built in 1995.

2* According to the City of Raleigh’s and Wake County’s iMAPS tool, the lot totals approximately 5,100 SF. The footprint of the house with its existing deck and porches is roughly 1,695 SF, while the application indicates the existing paved areas (patio, driveway...
and walkways) adds another 700 SF, bringing the total built area to 2,395 SF or 47% built area to open space. The new kitchen, walkway, deck, ramp, patio and workshop total 724.75 SF, thus the new total built area would be roughly 3,120 SF or 61% built area to open space.

3* The applicant provided additional documentation to support their argument for the proposed design. The documentation consists of maps that identify properties in Oakwood that are built out in similar proportions, as well as a sampling of properties with more detailed site plans and photos.

4* The lot currently includes a number of canopy trees and two groupings of hollies. The plans appear to remove only one of the hollies from the grouping at the northwest corner of the lot. No other trees will be removed.

5* An ISA-certified arborist report indicates that the only tree of concern is the crape myrtle opposite the site of the new outdoor kitchen. A tree protection plan details steps that will be taken to protect it.

6* The outdoor kitchen will replace an existing bed of roses on the southwest corner of the house. No elevation drawings or specifications for the kitchen were provided.

7* A photograph was provided of a replacement lantern, but no specifications were given.

8* The new patio extends the hardscape area into the lawn. It will be constructed of natural stone pavers with a fire bowl in the center of the north section, and it will be edged with sections of seat walls. It leads to a wall fountain on the west fence. Neither the stone pavers nor the wall fountain were presented with the application.

B. The installation of a brick walkway is not incongruous in concept according to Guidelines 1.5.1, 1.5.5, 1.5.6, 1.5.9, and the following suggested facts:

1* The brick walkway will replace an existing bluestone walkway and extend further to the backyard alongside the existing deck. A wood fence and trellis will be removed.

2* The brick will match the adjacent brick patio.
C. Building a small deck is not incongruous in concept according to Guidelines 3.1.1, 3.1.2, 3.1.3, 3.1.5, 3.1.6, 3.1.8, and the following suggested facts:
1* The deck will be for storage of trash and recycle bins. A small ramp will lead from the brick walkway to the raised deck.
2* The deck will be constructed to minimize damage to nearby trees.
3* No details were provided regarding the finish of the deck materials.

D. Constructing an accessory building is not incongruous in concept according to Guidelines 1.6.6, 1.6.7, 1.6.8, 1.6.11, 1.6.12, and the following suggested facts:
1* The proposed workshop is 112 SF. The workshop will be clad in siding and painted to match the house. No indication was given regarding trim materials or roofing.
2* Windows are shown on the elevation drawings, and appear to be either divided light or simulated divided light. No window specifications were provided.
3* Doors are shown as a pair of barn-style doors on a top rail. No door specifications were provided.
4* No specifications were provided for exterior lighting on the accessory building, although the application states that electricity will be run to it.

Staff has made no determination regarding the built area to open space, leaving this determination to the committee. If the committee chooses to approve the application, staff suggests the following conditions:

1. That details and specifications for the following be provided to and approved by staff prior to issuance of the blue placard for the accessory building:
   a. Windows.
   b. Trim materials;
   c. Roofing;
   d. Doors.

2. That details and specifications for the following be provided to and approved by staff prior to issuance of the blue placard for other items:
   a. Elevation drawings or specifications for the kitchen;
b. Stone pavers;

3. That details and specifications for the following be provided to and approved by staff prior to installation or construction:
   a. Lighting;
   b. Wall fountain;
   c. Deck stain/paint