COA-0014-2019
407 N BLOUNT STREET
BLOUNT STREET
HISTORIC DISTRICT (R-10)
Raleigh Historic Landmark

Nature of Project:
Remove non-historic addition and stairs; construct additions on south and west facades; construct new side porch; enlarge parking area; add new rear walk

APPLICANT:
LAURIE JACKSON FOR MAURER ARCHITECTURE
APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS – STAFF REPORT

COA-0014-2019 407 N BLOUNT STREET
Applicant: LAURIE JACKSON FOR MAURER ARCHITECTURE
Received: 1/16/19  Meeting Date(s): 04/16/19 1) 02/28/2019 2) 3)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: BLOUNT STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT
Raleigh Historic Landmark: ANDREWS-DUNCAN HOUSE
Zoning: HOD-G
Nature of Project: Remove non-historic addition and stairs; construct additions on south and west facades; construct new side porch; enlarge parking area; add new rear walk

Staff Notes:
• COA cases mentioned are available for review.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Description of Work</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>Site Features and Plantings</td>
<td>Enlarge parking area; construct additions on south and west facades</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>Walkways, Driveways, &amp; Off-street Parking</td>
<td>Enlarge parking area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>Entrances, Porches, and Balconies</td>
<td>Construct porch on south facade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Additions</td>
<td>Remove non-historic addition; Remove exterior stairs; Construct additions on south and west facades</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

STAFF REPORT

Based on the information contained in the application and staff’s evaluation:

A. Removing a non-historic addition; constructing additions on the south and west facades; removing exterior stairs; and enlarging a parking area are not incongruous in concept according to Guidelines 1.3.1, 1.3.2, 1.3.6, 1.3.7, 1.3.8, 1.3.13, 1.5.5, 1.5.6, 1.5.7, 2.8.6, 3.2.1, 3.2.2, 3.2.6, 3.2.7, 3.2.8, 3.2.9, 3.2.10, 3.2.11, 3.2.12; however, the lack of a tree protection plan is incongruous according to Guidelines 1.5.9, 3.2.4, 3.2.5, and the following suggested facts:

1* The National Register of Historic Places nomination for the Blount Street Historic District describes the house as: “Built for Alexander Boyd Andrews about 1873, this boxy, two-and-
a-half-story Victorian Italianate frame dwelling has broad gables and cross-gables with long returns and deep eaves. Supporting the eaves are pairs of highly sculptural brackets. Two large, paneled chimneys with corbelled stacks figure prominently in the building’s silhouette. A rectangular porch with paired, and at the corners tripled, posts fronts and central three bays of the house. The windows have segmental-arched hood moldings, except for the central windows of the front elevation on the second and third levels, which are pairs of Roman-arched openings under a single broad hoodmolding.”

2* The applicant proposes the removal of a non-historic addition on the south façade and the removal of the deck and stairs on the east façade.

3* First floor windows on the south and west sides were converted to doors at some point. The application proposes to remove the doors and reinstall windows “to match existing”; specifications are not included in the application.

4* The elevations note that four non-historic infill windows on the north façade will be removed and replaced “to match existing.” Photographs of the north façade were not provided. Window specifications were not provided.

5* The proposed addition on the south façade is to be constructed on the extant historic stone foundation that remains from the original porch. The addition has the appearance of an enclosed reconstruction of the original porch design.

6* A new porch built on brick piers is proposed to extend from the addition along the south façade. The proposed porch design visually complements the historic structure by using simplified elements of the original porch design – specifically balustrades that resemble a lengthened version of the historic balustrade and columns – but does not present itself as a false historic addition.

7* A one-story ~100 SF addition with rooftop balcony is proposed for the west façade. Details on the balcony railing were not provided.

8* The west façade addition is inset 8” from the rear wall of the structure.

9* The form of the rear addition is simple and boxy.

10* The additions are proposed to be sheathed in wood siding and trim that matches the existing.

11* A flat-pan metal roof is proposed for the additions and to replace the existing membrane roof on the one-story additions.
12* Built area to open space analysis: According to the applicant, the lot is 13,045 SF. Sanborn maps from 1914-1950 show approximately 3,450 SF of built area, with a ratio of built area to open space of 26%. The existing built area is 3,853 SF, with a ratio of built area to open space of 29%. The proposed built area is 5,073 SF, with a ratio of built area to open space of 39%.

13* Four gravel parking spaces are proposed from the recently created driveway/easement across the rear of the property. The proposed spaces are located behind the house with limited visibility from N. Blount Street.

14* A brick paved walkway is shown on the site plan. Details were not provided.

15* Several mature trees were identified on a site plan; however, their critical root zones were not identified and no tree protection plan was provided.

Staff suggests that the Committee defer the application until a tree protection plan prepared by an arborist certified by the International Society of Arboriculture (ISA) or by a North Carolina licensed landscape architect that addresses the critical root zones and provides staging areas for construction activity and material storage is provided.

Should the Committee choose to make a decision staff suggests the committee approve the application with the following conditions:

1. That a tree protection plan be implemented and remain in place for the duration of construction.

2. That porch footings be dug by hand and located to avoid damage to tree roots, should any be encountered during construction of the fence. Roots larger than 1” caliper will be cut cleanly using proper tools such as loppers.

3. That details and specifications for the following be provided to and approved by staff prior to construction or installation:
   a. Window specifications;
   b. Balcony railing details;
   c. Brick walkway details.

Staff Contact: Collette Kinane, collette.kinane@raleighnc.gov
Raleigh Historic Development Commission – Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) Application

☐ Minor Work (staff review) – 1 copy
☐ Major Work (COA Committee review) – 10 copies
  ☐ Additions Greater than 25% of Building Square Footage
  ☐ New Buildings
  ☐ Demo of Contributing Historic Resource
  ☐ All Other

☐ Post Approval Re-review of Conditions of Approval

Property Street Address: 467 North Blount St.
Historic District: North Blount St. Historic District
Historic Property/Landmark name (if applicable): Andrews Duncan House
Owner's Name: State of North Carolina
Lot size: 0.03 acres (width in feet) 94 feet (depth in feet) 140 feet

For applications that require review by the COA Committee (Major Work), provide addressed, stamped envelopes to owners of all properties within 100 feet (i.e. both sides, in front (across the street), and behind the property) not including the width of public streets or alleys (Label Creator).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Property Address</th>
<th>Property Address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>See Attached</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For Office Use Only
Transaction #: 583137
File #: COA-0014-2019
Fee: $1,529
Amount Paid: $1,529
Received Date: 11/06/49
Received By: [Signature]
I understand that all applications that require review by the commission’s Certificate of Appropriateness Committee must be submitted by 4:00 p.m. on the application deadline; otherwise, consideration will be delayed until the following committee meeting. An incomplete application will not be accepted.

Type or print the following:

Applicant: Maurer Architecture

Mailing Address: 115.5 E. Hargett St. Ste 300

City: Raleigh  State: NC  Zip Code: 27601

Date: 01.16.19

Daytime Phone: 919.829.4969

Email Address: laurie@maurerarchitecture.com

Applicant Signature:

Will you be applying for rehabilitation tax credits for this project? ☐ Yes  ☐ No

Did you consult with staff prior to filing the application? ☐ Yes  ☐ No

Office Use Only

Type of Work:

Design Guidelines - Please cite the applicable sections of the design guidelines (www.rhdc.org).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section/Page</th>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Brief Description of Work (attach additional sheets as needed)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>See Attached</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Minor Work Approval (office use only)**

Upon being signed and dated below by the Planning Director or designee, this application becomes the Minor Work Certificate of Appropriateness. It is valid until _____________. Please post the enclosed placard form of the certificate as indicated at the bottom of the card. Issuance of a Minor Work Certificate shall not relieve the applicant, contractor, tenant, or property owner from obtaining any other permit required by City Code or any law. Minor Works are subject to an appeals period of 30 days from the date of approval.

**Signature (City of Raleigh) ___________________ Date ____________**

---

### TO BE COMPLETED BY APPLICANT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attach 8-1/2&quot; x 11&quot; or 11&quot; x 17&quot; sheets with written descriptions and drawings, photographs, and other graphic information necessary to completely describe the project. Use the checklist below to be sure your application is complete.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Minor Work  (staff review) – 1 copy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Major Work  (COA Committee review) – 10 copies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

1. **Written description.** Describe clearly and in detail the nature of your project. Include exact dimensions for materials to be used (e.g. width of siding, window trim, etc.)
   - [ ]

2. **Description of materials (Provide samples, if appropriate)**
   - [ ]

3. **Photographs of existing conditions are required. Minimum image size 4" x 6" as printed. Maximum 2 images per page.**
   - [ ]

4. **Paint Schedule (if applicable)**
   - [ ]

5. **Plot plan (if applicable). A plot plan showing relationship of buildings, additions, sidewalks, drives, trees, property lines, etc., must be provided if your project includes any addition, demolition, fences/walls, or other landscape work. Show accurate measurements. You may also use a copy of the survey you received when you bought your property. Revise the copy as needed to show existing conditions and your proposed work.**
   - [ ]

6. **Drawings showing existing and proposed work**
   - [ ] Plan drawings
   - [ ] Elevation drawings showing the façade(s)
   - [ ] Dimensions shown on drawings and/or graphic scale (required)
   - [ ] 11" x 17" or 8-1/2" x 11" reductions of full-size drawings. If reduced size is so small as to be illegible, make 11" x 17" or 8-1/2" x 11" snap shots of individual drawings from the big sheet.
   - [ ]

7. **Stamped envelopes addressed to all property owners within 100 feet of property not counting the width of public streets and alleys (required for Major Work). Use the Label Creator to determine the addresses.**
   - [ ]

8. **Fee (See Development Fee Schedule)**
   - [ ]
Andrews Duncan House
407 N. Blount St.

Summary of Work- Certificate of Appropriateness Major Works application (REVISED)

Built in 1879, the Andrews Duncan House is a Raleigh Historic Landmark (1972), located in the North Blount St. HD and was individually listed on the National Register of Historic Places in 1971. The building sits on a 0.03 acre parcel and has had modifications made to two porches on the south and west elevations. It is currently owned by the State of North Carolina. The building has been unoccupied for several years after being used as offices for the State; the prospective buyers plan to restore the property according to the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards and retain the original use of a single-family residence. There are also covenants on the property held by the State of North Carolina that ensure the protection of historic, character-defining elements on the exterior and interior of the building upon its sale. As part of the sale of buildings along the 400 block of N. Blount St., a 12’ easement was created to provide access to the block interior.

An existing, non-original addition is to be removed along with its brick foundation walls on the south elevation. The cut stone foundation of the original side porch is intact inside the newer brick foundation, and will be retained. Rebuilding a small addition on the existing cut stone foundation in this location is proposed. The design for the addition is based on a documentary image of the original porch and matches the existing porch details on the east elevation, see attached. A covered porch is proposed off of the south addition at the southwest corner of the building. Modifications have also been made to the west elevation of the building. The National Register nomination references a porch on the rear or west elevation similar to the porch on the front or east elevation. A door has been converted to a window (although the original architraves remain) and wooden stairs have been added to provide access to a first floor door. A separate set of wooden stairs provides access to a second floor door. The stairs and landings are to be removed, and a small, one-story addition is proposed for the west elevation of the building. The remainder of the building will be undisturbed and repaired/restored as required.

1.5 Walkways, Driveways and Offstreet Parking

1.5.5 An existing gravel parking area is located along the easement access to the block interior and is to be enlarged. Four parking spots measuring 9’-0” by 18’-0” are proposed. A 3’-0” paver walk providing circulation from the parking areas is proposed. The location of parking is based on the presence of a mature tree to be retained.

2.1 Wood

2.1.1 Existing lap siding is to be retained, repaired and replaced as required to match the existing.
2.1.3 Existing wood trim and other decorative features are to be retained, repaired and replaced as required to
match the existing.

2.2 Masonry
2.2.1 Remove non-original brick foundation on the south elevation and restore existing cut stone foundation
behind it.
2.2.5 The existing cut stone foundation is to be repaired as necessary.

2.5. Roofs
2.5.5 The existing slate roof is damaged but not beyond repair. The built-in gutter system will be repaired along
with any structural damage sustained by roof members. Existing downspouts will be replaced in kind. The existing
lower roofs are all membrane and are damaged beyond repair. A new flat pan metal roof (no striations) is
proposed for the new additions and the existing lower roof structure of the main house.

2.7 Windows and Doors
2.7.1-2.7.2 Two non-original doors installed in modified window openings will be removed on the south and west
elevations. Where possible, existing windows will be restored to these locations.
2.7.4 All existing original windows and door are to be repaired. Any new window will match the existing in design,
dimension, material and quality of material.

2.8 Entrances, Porches and Balconies
2.8.6 A new covered porch will be built at the southwest corner of the building matching in concept the details of
the documentary photograph and the existing historic porch on the east elevation.

2.10 Sustainability and Energy Retrofit
2.10.3 The existing mechanical units will be removed from the north side of the building. New exterior mechanical
units will be placed in the same general location.

3.2 Additions
3.2.4-3.2.5 A tree protection plan will be provided that shows the critical root zone for individual trees to be
retained and the location of tree protection fencing. There is a mature oak tree in close proximity to the building;
due to the location of the existing parking area, the soil has likely been compacted within the critical root zone of
this tree. In the material choice of gravel for the enlarged parking area and with the intention of hand digging to
excavate for the new covered porch pier foundations, the future owners plan to retain this tree and protect it
during construction activities.
3.2.8 The new addition on the south elevation is located where the original side porch was located, and the intent
is to rebuild on the existing cut stone foundation of the original porch. The new addition on the west or rear
elevation is set back from the existing building wall to differentiate the new construction. It is single story and is to
sheathed in wood siding to match the existing. Trim details of the additions will match existing trim details.
Certificate of Appropriateness Application

01- Existing East or Main Elevation

02 - Existing Southeast Corner of Building
Certificate of Appropriateness Application

05 - Existing Side Porch at Southwest Corner of Building

06 - Existing West Elevation
06- Henry Clay Oak c. 1917
Original porch on south elevation can be seen.
From the Albert Barden Collection, courtesy State Archives of NC. N.53.15.1653
EXISTING MASONRY FOUNDATION TO BE REMOVED

NEW ORIGINAL STONE PORCH FOUNDATION TO REMAIN

REMOVE EXISTING STAIRS TO BASEMENT ACCESS

NEW HAND DUG MASONRY PIERS AT COVERED PORCH, TYP.

NEW STAIR TO BASEMENT ACCESS AS NEEDED, VERIFY IN FIELD

EXISTING CUT STONE PORCH FOUNDATION, VERIFY DIMENSIONS IN FIELD

NEW WEST ADDITION

NEW STAIR TO BASEMENT ACCESS

EXISTING MASONRY FOUNDATION TO BE REMOVED

INDICATED WALLS, DOORS, FINISHES, ETC. TO BE REMOVED

ALL INTERIOR CHANGES TO BE APPROVED BY NC SHPO
REMOVE REAR DECK, RAILING & STAIRS

EXISTING PORCH TO REMAIN; REMOVE ANY DAMAGED WOOD SIDING, DECKING, CEILING OR TRIM FOR REPAIR

EXISTING ENCLOSED PORCH TO BE REMOVED; LABEL & STORE WINDOWS/TRANSOM

EXISTING CONCRETE WINGWALLS AND STEPS TO REMAIN, REMOVE DAMAGED CONCRETE

EXISTING PORCH TO REMAIN, REMOVE ANY DAMAGED WOOD SIDING, DECKING, CEILING OR TRIM FOR REPAIR

NEW 300 SF COVERED PORCH TO MATCH EXISTING HISTORIC PORCH PROFILES & TRIM

NEW SOUTH ADDITION ON EXISTING CUT STONE FOUNDATION TO MATCH EXISTING HISTORIC PORCH PROFILES & TRIM

COVERED PORCH

SOUTH ADDITION

NEW 105 SF WEST ADDITION

NEW STAIR TO GRADE

NEW 105 SF WEST ADDITION

11' - 0"

27' - 0"

9' - 0"

23' - 0"

9' - 9"

407 N. BLOUNT STREET PROPOSED FIRST FLOOR PLAN

SCALE: 3/32" = 1 - 0"

407 N. BLOUNT STREET EXISTING FIRST FLOOR PLAN

SCALE: 3/32" = 1 - 0"

DEMOLITION PLAN KEY

--- INDICATED WALLS, DOORS, FINISHES, ETC. TO BE REMOVED

05 10 20

0' - 8"
REMOVE EXISTING SIDE PORCH

REMOVE EXISTING STAIR, RAILINGS AND REAR LANDING

NEW METAL ROOF AT COVERED PORCH

NEW METAL ROOF AT SOUTH ADDITION

2ND FL BALCONY AT NEW 1-STORY WEST ADDITION

INDICATED WALLS, DOORS, FINISHES, ETC. TO BE REMOVED

ALL INTERIOR CHANGES TO BE APPROVED BY NC SHPO
REMOVE EXISTING MEMBRANE ROOFING AT LOWER ROOFS

NEW METAL ROOF AT SOUTH ADDITION BELOW

NEW METAL ROOF AT COVERED PORCH BELOW

REMOVE EXISTING SIDE ADDITION BELOW

NEW METAL ROOFING

407 N. BLOUNT STREET PROPOSED THIRD FLOOR PLAN
SCALE: 3/32" = 1' - 0"

407 N. BLOUNT STREET EXISTING THIRD FLOOR PLAN
SCALE: 3/32" = 1' - 0"

DESTRUCTION PLAN KEY

- - - - INDICATED WALLS, DOORS, FINISHES, ETC. TO BE REMOVED

ALL INTERIOR CHANGES TO BE APPROVED BY NC SHPO

Maurer Architecture
919 829 4969
NEW COVERED PORCH METAL ROOF BELOW

ONE STORY WEST ADDITION BELOW

REMOVE EXISTING LOWER MEMBRANE ROOFING

NEW METAL ROOFING ON EXISTING LOWER ROOFS

REMOVE EXISTING SIDE PORCH ROOF

NEW SOUTH ADDITION METAL ROOF BELOW

ONE STORY WEST ADDITION BELOW

NEW METAL ROOFING ON EXISTING LOWER ROOFS

REMOVE EXISTING SIDE PORCH ROOF

NEW SOUTH ADDITION METAL ROOF BELOW

SCALE: 3/32" = 1'-0"

SCALE: 3/32" = 1'-0"

DEMOLITION PLAN KEY

= INDICATED WALLS, DOORS, FINISHES, ETC. TO BE REMOVED

MAURER architecture

919 829 4969

407 N. BLOUNT STREET EXISTING ROOF PLAN

407 N. BLOUNT STREET PROPOSED ROOF PLAN
EXISTING

REMOVE ENCLOSED PORCH & MASONRY FOUNDATION

407 N. BLOUNT STREET EAST ELEVATION
SCALE: 1/8" = 1'-0"

DEMOLITION PLAN KEY
--- -- --- --- INDICATED WALLS, DOORS, FINISHES, ETC. TO BE REMOVED
NEW SOUTH PORCH ADDITION
TO MATCH EXISTING
PORCH DETAILING, TYPICAL

PROPOSED

407 N. BLOUNT STREET EAST ELEVATION
SCALE: 1/8" = 1'-0"

REPAIR EXISTING CONCRETE
STEPS, WING WALL AND CAPS
EXISTING

REMOVE NON-ORIGINAL INFILL THESE WINDOWS

REMOVE EXISTING MEMBRANE ROOF, TYP.

407 N. BLOUNT STREET NORTH ELEVATION

SCALE: 1/8" = 1'-0"

DEMOLITION PLAN KEY

--- --- --- --- --- INDICATED WALLS, DOORS, FINISHES, ETC. TO BE REMOVED
NEW WINDOW TO MATCH EXISTING

NEW METAL STANDING SEAM ROOF, TYP.

REPAIR EXISTING CONCRETE STEPS, WING WALL & CAPS

NEW WINDOWS TO MATCH EXISTING

407 N. BLOUNT STREET NORTH ELEVATION
SCALE: 1/8" = 1'-0"
REMOVE EXISTING MEMBRANE ROOF

REMOVE DOOR AND WINDOW IN MODIFIED OPENINGS

REMOVE EXISTING INFILL AT BASEMENT ACCESS

REMOVE NON-ORIGINAL DOOR, SOUTH ADDITION & MASONRY FOUNDATION

EXISTING

DEMOLITION PLAN KEY

--- --- INDICATED WALLS, DOORS, FINISHES, ETC. TO BE REMOVED
NEW ONE STORY ADDITION ON WEST ELEVATION TO MATCH EXISTING SIDING & TRIM DETAILS, TYPICAL

NEW METAL 42" GUARDRAIL AT ROOF DECK, TYPICAL

NEW ONE-STORY ADDITION ON WEST ELEVATION TO MATCH EXISTING SIDING & TRIM DETAILS, TYPICAL

NEW MASONRY FDN AT WEST ADDITION, TYPICAL

NEW STANDING SEAM METAL ROOF, TYP.

NEW SOUTH ADDITION AND COVERED PORCH ADDITION TO MATCH EXISTING PORCH DETAILING, TYPICAL

LATTICE PROPOSED AT WEST SIDE OF NEW PORCH STAIR
REMOVE EXISTING MEMBRANE ROOF

REMOVE EXISTING WINDOW AND TRIM FOR REUSE

REPLACE MODIFIED WINDOW OPENINGS WITH NEW WINDOWS

REMOVE NON-ORIGINAL ENCLOSED PORCH AND MASONRY FOUNDATION.

LABEL & STORE WINDOWS/TRANSOMS

DEMOLITION PLAN KEY

---|---

---| INDICATED WALLS, DOORS, FINISHES, ETC. TO BE REMOVED

SCALE: 1/8" = 1'-0"
NEW STANDING SEAM METAL ROOFING, TYP.
NEW WOOD SIDING & TRIM TO MATCH EXISTING
NEW SOUTH ADDITION ON EXISTING CUT STONE FDN TO MATCH EXISTING PORCH DETAILING, TYPICAL
NEW SINGLE STORY ADDITION W/ MASONRY FDN & ROOF DECK
NEW 16x16 BRICK PIERS AT COVERED PORCH
REPAIR EXISTING CONCRETE STAIRS, WING WALL & CAP

PROPOSED

407 N. BLOUNT STREET SOUTH ELEVATION
SCALE: 1/8" = 1'-0"
EXISTING TO PROPOSED BUILT AREAS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>SF</th>
<th>% OF 13045 SF SITE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EXISTING, INCLUDING SOUTH PORCH</td>
<td>3853 SF</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROPOSED</td>
<td>5073 SF</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
EXISTING WALKWAY TO REMAIN

NEW 110 SF ADDITION

NEW 300 SF COVERED PORCH

NEW 260 SF ADDITION

332 SF GRAVEL PARKING AREA

162 SF GRAVEL PARKING AREA

EXISTING MATURE TREE TO REMAIN

EXISTING MONUMENT TO REMAIN

EXISTING MATURE TREE TO REMAIN