

APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS – STAFF REPORT

 COA-0157-2018
 405 E FRANKLIN STREET

 <u>Applicant</u>:
 JAMES AND RACHEL BAILEY

 <u>Received</u>:
 10/10/2018

 <u>Submission date + 90 days</u>:
 01/08/2019

 1) 11/26/2018
 2)

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

<u>Historic District</u>: OAKWOOD HISTORIC DISTRICT <u>Zoning</u>: HOD-G <u>Nature of Project</u>: Demolish house and garage; remove 3 Willow Oak trees; seed and straw parcel

Staff Notes:

- Unified Development Code section 10.2.15.E.1 provides that "An application for a certificate of appropriateness authorizing the demolition or destruction of a building, structure or site within any Historic Overlay District...may not be denied.... However, the authorization date of such a certificate may be delayed for a period of up to 365 days from the date of issuance.... If the Commission finds that the building, structure or site has no particular significance or value toward maintaining the character of the Historic Overlay District or Historic Landmark, it shall waive all or part of such period and authorize earlier demolition or removal."
- The boundary of the HOD runs through the garage proposed for demolition. Only the portion of the garage in the HOD is subject to review.

APPLICABLE SECTIONS OF GUIDELINES and DESCRIPTION OF PROJECT

Sections	Topic	Description of Work
1.3	Site Features and Setting	remove trees
4.2	Demolition	demolish house and garage

STAFF REPORT

Based on the information contained in the application and staff's evaluation:

- A. Demolition of the house and garage is not incongruous according to *Guidelines* section 4.2.1,
 4.2.2, 4.2.4, 4.2.5; however, removal of three trees is incongruous according to *Guidelines* section 1.3.5, and the following suggested facts:
- 1* Three Willow Oak trees are proposed for removal: a 22", 28", and a 30" diameter, all located along the west property line of the site. An arborist's letter was provided; however, the letter did not include an assessment on the health of the trees.

- 2* A tree protection plan was provided for the remaining trees on the site. The plan states that the critical root zones were provided on the arborist letter. The letter provided, however, did not mention the trees not proposed for removal.
- 3* No replacement trees were proposed for the three trees proposed for removal.
- The application includes pages from the "Inventory of Structures in The Oakwood National 4* Register Historic Districts" Raleigh, North Carolina By Matthew Brown, Historian, Society for the Preservation of Historic Oakwood Researched and written from 2004 to 2015. That document includes the following statements:
 - a. "Those built 1939 or later arc listed as non-contributing (NC), following the designation in current National Register documents, which designation accords with the judgment of the author of this inventory."
 - "=WA6760 (NC) 405 E. Franklin St. Vernon C. Huff House c.1947 This Colonial b. Revival cottage was built by building contractor Vernon Huff for his own family's home. It remains in the family as of 2014. The house is sided in asbestos shingles. It has a side-gabled saddle roof with no eaves. There is a gabled projection on the leftward part of the front, and a porch on the rightward part of the front. The porch has a hipped roof supported by X-patterned fretwork posts. There is a large picture window on the porch. There is a double window on the gabled projection. There is an original gabled section behind the main block. On the left side of the house is a nearly-flat-roofed section added in the 1950s. It has a large picture window on the front of it, flanked by six-over-six windows. There is a shed at the northwest corner of the lot, built in 1970 according to tax records. There is a carport in front of the shed built in 1975 according to tax records."
- 5^{*} The subject property is within the original boundaries of Oakwood Historic Districts listed in the National Register in 1974. That nomination form does not contain an inventory list nor a clearly defined period of significance. The Commission has generally used the mid-1930s as the end date.
- 6^* The applicant states that the building is structurally unsound. A statement from a professional structural engineer was provided to support the statement.
- 7* The application does not present any evidence that the applicant has fully documented the buildings with photographs and drawings and deposited these materials with RHDC for storage. COA-0157-2018

8* The garage is partially located within the boundaries of the Oakwood Historic District. Information on the garage was not included in the application (except for a notation on the site plan), but it should be considered as part of this application.

Staff suggests that the committee defer a decision on the application pending receipt of a tree protection plan prepared by a certified arborist or registered landscape architect.

If the committee chooses to render a decision staff suggests that it approve the application with the following conditions:

- 1. That a 365-day demolition delay not be put into place for the garage and house.
- 2. That a 365-day demolition delay be implemented for the removal of the 3 Willow Oak trees.
- 3. That the replacement trees be 3" caliper or greater.
- 4. That prior to the issuance of the blue placard the following be provided to and approved by staff:
 - a. full documentation of the buildings with photographs and drawings;
 - b. location and species of replacement trees.

Raleigh Historic Development Commission – Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) Application



DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT Development Services Customer Service Center One Exchange Plaza 1 Exchange Plaza, Suite 400 Raleigh, North Carolina 27601 Phone 919 996-2495 eFax 919-996-1831



For Office Use Only Minor Work (staff review) – 1 copy Major Work (COA Committee review) - 10 copies Transaction # Additions Greater than 25% of Building Square Footage File # New Buildings Fee Demo of Contributing Historic Resource Amount Paid All Other Received Date Post Approval Re-review of Conditions of Approval Received By Property Street Address 405 E. Franklin Historic District Oakwood Historic Property/Landmark name (if applicable) Owner's Name James Bailey, Rachel Bailey Lot size .32 (width in feet) 67 (depth in feet) 304 For applications that require review by the COA Committee (Major Work), provide addressed, stamped envelopes to owners of all properties within 100 feet (i.e. both sides, in front (across the street), and behind the property) not including the width of public streets or alleys (Label Creator). **Property Address Property Address** 502 E FRANKLIN ST 720, 710 N BLOODWORTH ST 501 E FRANKLIN ST 408 E FRANKLIN ST 503 E FRANKLIN ST 800 N BLOODWORTH ST 504 HOLDEN ST 804 N BLOODWORTH ST 508 HOLDEN ST 806 N BLOODWORTH ST 510 HOLDEN ST 808 N BLOODWORTH ST

WWW.RALEIGHNC.GOV

I understand that all applications that require review by the commission's Certificate of Appropriateness Committee must be submitted by 4:00 p.m. on the application deadline; otherwise, consideration will be delayed until the following committee meeting. An incomplete application will not be accepted.

Type or print the following:		Section of the section			
Applicant James Bailey					
Mailing Address 107 Cook	e St				
city Raleigh	State NC	Zip Code 27601			
Date 10/9/18	Daytime Phone 704-502-4748				
Email Address baileyjames	7@gmail.com, rabailey1@me.com	1			
Will you be applying for rehabilita Did you consult with staff prior to	ation tax credits for this project? Yes	Office Use Only Type of Work			

Section/Page	Topic	Brief Description of Work (attach additional sheets as needed)		
4.2	Demolition	Demolish existing structure; seed and straw. Remove willow oak trees.		

WWW.RALEIGHNC.GOV

Minor Work Approval (office use only)

Upon being signed and dated below by the Planning Director or designee, this application becomes the Minor Work Certificate of Appropriateness. It is valid until ______. Please post the enclosed placard form of the certificate as indicated at the bottom of the card. Issuance of a Minor Work Certificate shall not relieve the applicant, contractor, tenant, or property owner from obtaining any other permit required by City Code or any law. Minor Works are subject to an appeals period of 30 days from the date of approval.

Signature (City of Raleigh)

Date

TO BE COMPLETED BY APPLICANT				TO BE COMPLETED BY CITY STAFF		
	YES	N/A	YES	NO	N/A	
Attach 8-1/2" x 11" or 11" x 17" sheets with written descriptions and drawings, photographs, and other graphic information necessary to completely describe the project. Use the checklist below to be sure your application is complete.						
Minor Work (staff review) – 1 copy						
Major Work (COA Committee review) - 10 copies						
 Written description. Describe clearly and in detail the nature of your project. Include exact dimensions for materials to be used (e.g. width of siding, window trim, etc.) 	×					
Description of materials (Provide samples, if appropriate)	×					
 Photographs of existing conditions are required. Minimum image size 4" x 6" as printed. Maximum 2 images per page. 	×					
4. Paint Schedule (if applicable)		×				
 Plot plan (if applicable). A plot plan showing relationship of buildings, additions, sidewalks, drives, trees, property lines, etc., must be provided if your project includes any addition, demolition, fences/walls, or other landscape work. Show accurate measurements. You may also use a copy of the survey you received when you bought your property. Revise the copy as needed to show existing conditions and your proposed work. 	x					
Drawings showing existing and proposed work						
Plan drawings						
 Elevation drawings showing the façade(s) 						
 Dimensions shown on drawings and/or graphic scale (required) 	x					
11" x 17" or 8-1/2" x 11" reductions of full-size drawings. If reduced size is so small as to be illegible, make 11" x 17" or 8-1/2" x 11" snap shots of individual drawings from the big sheet.						
 Stamped envelopes addressed to all property owners within 100 feet of property not counting the width of public streets and alleys (required for Major Work). Use the <u>Label Creator</u> to determine the addresses. 	×					
8. Fee (See Development Fee Schedule)	x					

November 5, 2018 James & Rachel Bailey 107 Cooke St. Raleigh, NC 27601 704-502-4748 (m) baileyjames7@gmail.com, rabailey1@me.com

RHDC and CoA committee members,

Please find attached the application for Certificate of Approval for demolition of the current structure at 405 E. Franklin St. We are requesting issuance of the blue placard without delay as a result of irreparable damage to the structure and in accordance with UDO 10.2.15.E.1: *If the Commission finds that the building, structure or site has no particular significance or value toward maintaining the character of the Historic Overlay District or Historic Landmark, it shall waive all or part of such period and authorize earlier demolition or removal.*

In addition, neglect has resulted in the deterioration of structural components significant enough to make restoration inadvisable in the opinion of consulted construction professionals. *See attached certified engineer report.* In summary of that report, previous neglect has resulted in water intrusion which has lead to systematic mold and rot throughout the structure. In the engineer's opinion, the damage is beyond what can reasonably be repaired. Even if significant remediation efforts were undertaken, it is likely that mold would still remain resulting in an unsafe living environment. His recommendation is that the entire structure be razed.

Given the non-contributing nature of the property and unrepairable nature of the damage resulting from the systematic existence of mold throughout the structure, it is our position that the 365-day delay is not in the best interest of the overlay in general, nor in the interest of the homeowners in the immediate vicinity. No delay would provide us the ability to rebuild as soon as possible, contributing to the fabric of the 400 block of E Franklin St., creating new and lasting value for our neighbors, the City of Raleigh, and Historic Oakwood.

On a personal note, we live in the immediate area today and have been looking for a project in Oakwood for some time now. This is not an investment opportunity. This is a "forever home" for ourselves and our two young sons. The values and aesthetics of Historic Oakwood are what attract us to the neighborhood. We look forward to contributing to its perpetuation as citizens of Oakwood and by designing a new home that meets RHDC/CoA guidelines, transforming 405 E. Franklin into a property that might be considered "contributing" to the historic fabric of Oakwood in the future.

Best, James & Rachel Bailey















November 2, 2018

Michael Ali, PE 5108 Glen Forest Drive Raleigh, NC 27612

James Bailey 107 Cooke Street Raleigh, NC 27601

RE: Single Family Home 405 East Franklin Street Raleigh, NC 27601 Structural Evaluation Report

Dear Mr. Bailey:

On Friday, October 26, 2018, I performed a limited visual investigation at the above referenced property. The following services were provided: Structural evaluation of the entire residence. The 1-story home is 1,857-sqft in size and is situated on the southern end of a 0.32-acre lot near the intersection of E Franklin and N East Streets in the Historic Oakwood district. The original home was constructed in 1947. A renovation / addition occurred circa 1970. The home was unoccupied at the time of my visit.

The 71-year old residence was constructed using materials and practices common to the 1940's. The roof is comprised of asphalt shingles over horizontal 1x roof planking over rough cut lumber rafters. Drywall ceilings are supported by lumber joists which are in-turn supported by wood stud

bearing walls of unknow size or spacing. The ground floor is largely constructed over a shallow crawlspace. A small portion is built over a full height basement. The floor is comprised of diagonal 1x floor planks over rough cut timber joists which are supported by masonry crawlspace walls. Visible floor finishes include carpet (installed over oak hardwood flooring), ceramic tile, hardwood flooring and vinyl tile.

General Observations and Concerns

- The asphalt shingles are at the end of their serviceable life. Water infiltration and or rot may occur.
- Several gutters have displaced and are not draining properly.
- Many downspouts have disengaged from the gutters and water spills directly to grade (i.e. at the foundation walls.) There are no splash blocks. The potential for building settlement exists.



405 East Franklin Street Raleigh, NC 27601 Page 2 of 7

- Paint is peeling from the eave and gable end trim. Water has likely wicked into the wood and possibly the edge-most roofing planks.
- The paint is chipping / pealing at many exterior window sills and jambs. The wood is soft: a blade can be inserted $\frac{1}{4}$ " - $\frac{1}{2}$ ".
- Approximately 20% of the roof rafters have shrunk due to moisture loss (Photo 1 / previous page). A number of these have significantly disengaged member-end connections at the ridge.
- The chimney has displaced outward and the base is cracked on all sides. A steel bracket was installed by a previous home owner but it is situated between the roof and ceiling diaphragms. The structural adequacy of the brace could not be verified.
- The home interior is humid. There is no vapor barrier in the crawlspace.
- The home smells of cat urine and is musty. There are notable urine stains on the carpet throughout the house. Stains are dark and have likely permeated into the wood flooring.
- Wood wall boards behind the radiators are soft and covered in mold.



- Photo 2
- The westernmost bathroom tile has cracked. The crack is approximately 3'-0" long and extends from the vanity to the exterior wall. The crack propagates through both grout joints and tile fields suggesting that the floor has settled. This is typically a result of rot catalyzed by water infiltration into the subfloor.
- Clusters of floor joists throughout the crawlspace are supported by wood cribbing. Cribbing posts are founded directly on the crawlspace soils. Many post bases are damp and deteriorated (Photo 2). Some cribbing has racked.

Significant Structural and Whole Building Concerns

There were five significant structural or whole building concerns observed during my visit. Four zones of concern have been labeled A thru D on the Floor Plan to the right. A fifth zone (not labeled) applies to the entire crawlspace. Note - The bottom edge of the floor plan faces East Franklin Street. Zones in red occur at the floor level. Green zones occur at the basement.

Zone A: This small room does not appear to be original • to the house and is approximately 50sqft in size. The wall boards are soft and spongy. There is evidence of widespread termite damage and mold (Photo 3, Photo



Floor Plan

405 East Franklin Street Raleigh, NC 27601 Page **3** of **7**

4 and Photo 5). Given the advanced stages of deterioration, it's possible that termites or mold have travelled into the abutting main house walls.

- Zone B: The porch columns have rotted (Photo 6) and the roof structure is sagging. The porch is unsafe.
- Zone C: The northern bedrooms, closets, easternmost bathroom and central-eastern living space are riddled with mold (Photo 7, Photo 8 and Photo 9). The mold is black, white or brown. The living space's southern wall is also water damaged and rotting near its eastern end (Photo 10). Water infiltration at roof offsets, roof eaves and window surrounds appear to be the primary source of the mold and decay. A previous home owner installed circular wall vents in the drywall, presumably attempting to lessen moisture within the wall cavity (Photo 11). The bathroom ceiling was refinished but new mold has appeared. Both suggest that a significant amount of mold is in the wall and ceiling cavities, drywall and wood. Additionally, the easternmost bathroom's main sanitary line has an active leak in the crawlspace (Photo 12). This leak has rotted several floor joists and 1x floor planks. Heavy mold exists in proximity of the leak.
- Zone D: An unknown source of water has eroded the crawlspace soils and saturated a central basement wall (Photo 13). The depth of the flow channels suggests that infiltration has occurred for a prolonged period. Recent mud deposits on the basement floor suggest the infiltration is recent or ongoing (Photo 14). The source of water could not be determined during my visit. The seemingly large amount of water entering the crawlspace has saturated the soils at basement wall bearing. Significant settlement due to direct erosion and or saturation-drying cycles is likely.
- Zone Entire Crawlspace: A significant number of floor joists (visible from within the crawlspace and basement areas) are covered in mold. The mold is yellow, black and white.

Recommendations

The deferred maintenance efforts of a previous home owner have resulted in significant amounts of mold throughout the back half of the house and the west addition. Water infiltration has clearly rotted many load bearing walls in these areas. It is my opinion that the amounts of mold and rot are beyond what can be reasonably repaired. The "general observations and concerns" listed above solidify this opinion. Furthermore, studies have shown that mold rich dwellings are unsafe for small children. Even upon completion of a significant and lengthy remediation effort, it's likely that some mold will remain and spread.

I recommend that the entire home be razed. Given the types of mold and decay observed, a regulated "waiting period" would be counter-productive as the mold and rot will continue to spread. Conditions will worsen and could present a hazard to neighbors.

I was contracted to make a limited visual observation of the structure and alert the owner of structural defects. This report is based upon clearly visible, open and unobstructed areas of the premises on the date of observation. No opinion is rendered with regard to structural elements which were concealed or are outside of the contracted scope. This limited observation does not

405 East Franklin Street Raleigh, NC 27601 Page **4** of **7**

guarantee the structural integrity of the total premises under its current use or any proposed alterations.

If you have any questions, or require additional information, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Michael Ali, PE NCPE 032963



405 East Franklin Street Raleigh, NC 27601 Page **5** of **7**





Photo 5





Photo 6

405 East Franklin Street Raleigh, NC 27601 Page **6** of **7**



Photo 7





Photo 9



Photo 10

405 East Franklin Street Raleigh, NC 27601 Page **7** of **7**





Photo 13



Photo 12



Photo 14



BARTLETT TREE EXPERTS

5808 Triangle Drive, Raleigh, NC 27617 Telephone 919-782-7803 Fax 919-788-9147

11/02/18

To whom it may concern:

Upon meeting with James and Rachel Bailey at 405 E Franklin Street to review the trees on the property, the following areas were noted. The trees in question are 3 Willow Oaks located at the back left side of the property and 5 Crape Myrtles located at the front along E Franklin Street.

- Willow Oak 1 which is closest to the front, has a DBH of 30" and a critical root zone radius of 12.5' from the base of the tree.
- Willow Oak 2 which is in the middle, has a DBH of 28" and a critical root zone radius of 11.5' from the base of the tree.
- Willow Oak 3 which is farthest from the street, has a DBH of 22" and a critical root zone radius of 9.5' from the base of the tree.
- The 5 Crape Myrtles along E Franklin St all have a DBH of less than 12" and a critical root zone radius of 5-6' from the base of each tree.

These areas of the critical root zone are "no zones" for any trenching, excavating, heavy compaction, or major disturbance, as those actions will severely and negatively impact the health and structural integrity of any of these trees.

Bartlett Tree Experts is prepared to work alongside the homeowners during the construction and landscaping to maintain these critical root zones and maintain the overall health and vitality of the trees that remain in the final landscape plan.

Please reach out with any questions.

Thank you,

Jared Kibbe ISA Certified Arborist #SO-7534A Arborist Representative – Raleigh, NC

THE F.A. BARTLETT TREE EXPERT COMPANY

SCIENTIFIC TREE CARE SINCE 1907